



STATE OF WASHINGTON
OFFICE OF FINANCIAL MANAGEMENT

STATE HUMAN RESOURCES DIVISION | DIRECTOR'S REVIEW PROGRAM
P.O. Box 40911 · Olympia, WA 98504-0911 · (360) 407-4101 · FAX (360) 586-4694

September 21, 2016

TO: Connie Goff
WPPRA Section Chief

FROM: Meredith Huff, SPHR, MPA
Director's Review Specialist

SUBJECT: Bruce Moen v. Skagit Valley College (SVC)
Allocation Review Request ALLO-16-016

Director's Determination

This position review is based on the work performed for the six-month period prior to January 22, 2016 (July 22, 2015-January 22, 2016), the date that SVC Human Resources (HR) received Bruce Moen's request for a position review. As the Director's Review Specialist, I carefully considered all the documentation, exhibits, and written communication in the file, and the information provided by the parties during the telephone review conference. After review and analysis of Mr. Moen's assigned job duties and responsibilities, I conclude his position is appropriately allocated to the Maintenance Mechanic 2 (MM2) classification.

Background

Bruce Moen's completed and signed WGS Position Description Form was received in SVC HR on December 18, 2015. (Exhibit A-4)

Mr. Moen submitted a completed Position Review Request, Employee Portion, to SVC HR on January 22, 2016. (Exhibit A-2)

On February 18, 2016, Ms. Paula Sheldon, Employment Manager at Tacoma Community College provided Ms. Carolyn Tucker, SVC Executive Director of HR, with a written review of Mr. Moen's position. Ms. Sheldon found Maintenance Mechanic 2 was the appropriate allocation for Mr. Moen's position. (Exhibit B-2)

By letter dated February 23, 2016, Ms. Tucker notified Mr. Moen that his position remained allocated to Maintenance Mechanic 2. (Exhibit B-1)

On March 9, 2016, OFM-SHR Director's Review Program received Mr. Moen's request for a Director's Review of SVC's allocation determination. (Exhibit A-1)

On July 26, 2016, I conducted a phone conference review with Mr. Moen. Included in the conference were Mr. Dave Hauser, Mr. Moen's supervisor; Ms. Helen Kane, SVC HR Consultant and Ms. Paula Sheldon, Employment Specialist, Tacoma Community College.

Rationale for Director's Determination

The purpose of a position review is to determine which classification best describes the overall duties and responsibilities of a position. A position review is neither a measurement of the volume of work performed, nor an evaluation of the expertise with which that work is performed. A position review is a comparison of the duties and responsibilities of a particular position to the available classification specifications. This review results in a determination of the class that best describes the overall duties and responsibilities of the position. *Liddle-Stamper v. Washington State University*, PAB Case No. 3722-A2 (1994).

Organizational Structure

Skagit Valley College (SVC) has a main campus in Mount Vernon and branch educational facilities at Whidbey Island, Anacortes and Oak Harbor. Mr. Moen supports the SVC Whidbey Island educational facilities by providing repair and maintenance services. The Organizational Chart indicates Mr. Moen reports directly to Mr. David Hauser. Mr. Hauser reports to Ms. Laura Cailloux, Vice President, Whidbey Island Campus. (Exhibit B-7)

Position Review

Position Purpose, in part states:

The mission of SVC Whidbey Island is to provide a quality education to the people of Washington State, no matter their age, gender or disabilities. SVC Whidbey has five different campus locations to service...from South Whidbey to as far away as Friday Harbor in the San Juans. The Maintenance Mech 3* position supports this mission by providing all the work and skill in a variety of trades to maintain and improve the facilities and grounds of these campuses...that our students may have a high quality environment to pursue their education. (Exhibits A-4 and B-4)

When his supervisor, Mr. David Hauser, Buildings and Grounds Supervisor, is away from work, Mr. Moen indicates he is responsible for handling situations that occur, including emergencies. Mr. Moen assigns, directs and oversees the work of temporary and student employees. During the review conference, Mr. Moen and Mr. Hauser confirmed they are the only fulltime Buildings and Grounds employees at this site.

*Note: In Mr. Moen's Position Description and Position Review Request documents, he sometimes refers to his position as Maintenance Mechanic 3 (Mech 3). However, when he requested his position review, Mr. Moen's position was allocated to Maintenance Mechanic 2 classification.

Duties and Responsibilities (Exhibits A-4 and B-4) are summarized as follows:

30% Maintain, repair and remodel buildings

- Frame walls, hang sheetrock, tape, texture, finish and paint interior walls. Fit and hang doors and windows. Repair roofs, siding, and gutters. Design and fabricate custom counter tops, desks, doors, etc. for offices. Build benches for outside grounds. Concrete work...build forms and finish..for example, pad for our art sculpture. Repair and lay tile flooring, for example in the art classroom remodel.

30% Install, maintain, and repair all electrical, mechanical and plumbing systems

- Installing toilets, new sinks, repairing leaks and solving drain problems ...soldering copper water lines. Installing electrical light switches, outlets, etc. Maintaining emergency lighting systems, alarm panels and working with alarm company when problems occur. Installing new ignitors in H2O heaters...rewiring ballasts in lighting systems.

20% Maintain and repair heating and air conditioning systems in buildings

- Replacing computer operated damper control valves...stripping boiler apart, replacing new burners and ignitors. Using blueprints, troubleshoot air conditioning and heat problems. Install air conditioning unit for student government. Use Backtalk Allerton computer control system to troubleshoot and control heat and air conditioning in Oak Hall.

10% Preventive maintenance, troubleshoot and repair on a variety of equipment

- Maintaining all campus vehicles, oil changes, etc. Regular tire replacement, blades sharpened, oil changes on all mowers and grounds equipment. Repair of Biology labs, nursing classes' equipment and various ECAP equipment such as ice machines, dishwashers, etc. Maintain the college grounds and landscaping with mowers, weed-eaters, edgers, etc.

10% Operate heavy equipment to complete a variety of tasks

- Fork lift for moving heavy palletted deliveries. I have a state fork lift operator's license. Trac hoes for trenching and demolition clean up. Front loaders for moving dirt, rock, creating lawns, driveways, etc. Dump truck for deliveries.

Summary of Mr. Moen's Perspective

On the Position Review Request (PRR), Employee Portion, Mr. Moen states, in part:

"When our Mech 3 position was done away with, I have had to take on his responsibilities since there is only me now and my supervisor...I am the only mech on this campus. When [supervisor] is off on vacation or sick, I have to deal with all the issues on campus...ex: working with subcontractors getting repairs done, supervising and training part-time work study students. I believe I should be a Mech 3 as I do many skilled jobs on the campus, from new construction projects, remodeling classrooms and supervising employees. ...The Mech 3 supports the College by providing all the work and skill in a variety of trades to maintain and improve the facilities and grounds of

these campuses so our students may have a quality environment to pursue their education." Mr. Moen notes that SVC Whidbey Island has five different campus locations to service. (Exhibit A-2, pg. 3)

Mr. Moen indicates he leads and supervises three positions: two full-time seasonal employees and one part-time student employee. He states that he, "will train, assign jobs and supervise workers in the proper and safe use of tools to accomplish a variety of jobs maintaining the grounds and buildings on campus." His responsibilities are noted as "assigns work, plans work, instructs work, evaluates performance, checks others' work and takes corrective action". Mr. Moen clarifies that, "Most of our help are students who have very little experience with tools and must be trained and watched closely to make sure they do things safely and have a good understanding of how to accomplish a specific task." On the PRR Employee Portion, Mr. Moen noted: "I decide how to resolve problems between workers, train them to work safely with tools...supervise them to work safely...decide what jobs for them to do daily, etc. The hardest is dealing with their personal issues and resolving them in the work place which shouldn't be the responsibility of a mech 2." (Exhibit A-2, pg. 6)

During the phone conference Mr. Moen clarified that two temporary employees usually work full time during the summer breaks. He directs them in mowing lawns, pulling weeds, cleaning windows and other unskilled work that needs to be done. He also noted that a work study student may work part-time during the school year.

In describing his decision making authority, Mr. Moen noted that decisions he makes during his supervisor's absence include: "...decisions regarding repairs that I cannot fix...when to call subcontractors like plumbers, electricians, etc."

Mr. Moen noted, "I am the only one on campus with a WA State fork lift operator's license." He further noted, "When our Mech 3 position was done away with, I have had to take on his responsibilities since there is only me now and my supervisor...I am the only mech on this campus. When Dave [Hauser, supervisor] is off on vacation or sick I have to deal with all the issues on campus...ex: working with subcontractors getting repairs done."

Mr. Moen stated that email requests serve as tickets/work orders and they are printed and saved. He indicated that many of the jobs require knowledge of how to do maintenance and service equipment such as on boilers, air handlers, and vehicles. Additionally, as examples, he indicated that he is skilled at plumbing installations, removals and repairing leaks; installation and repair of lighting and wiring for electricity needs and vehicle maintenance such as oil changes and lubrication. He does maintenance and repairs on boilers and air handlers. Mr. Moen indicated that he does remodels in classrooms and buildings which may involve removing and/or installing walls, cabinets, doors, and windows. When his supervisor, Mr. Hauser, is gone, Mr. Moen handles any emergency that occurs. In some situations, he may schedule an off-campus subcontractor to complete emergency campus repairs. Mr. Moen stated he meets with scheduled contractors during Mr. Hauser's absence.

Mr. Moen provided a written rebuttal to Ms. Tucker's classification decision. He wrote, in part:

“To say that ‘the responsibilities of the mechanics on the main campus are not comparable with the responsibilities of the mechanics on our campus’ is just not true. ...We deal with all the same problems with our facilities as they do. If anything, I have more responsibilities as I am the only mechanic to take care of all problems and need to have “more skills” in more areas than the mechanics on our main campus....I hold many certificates from years of training in the USAF and my years of working for Shell Oil. They range from missile guidance and control systems, electronics, motors, compressors, hydraulic and pneumatic control systems, etc. ...my training in the fields far exceeds what you get in a college journeyman program. I believe that I do the same work and have the same responsibilities as those who are being paid at the Mech 3 level and have a greater variety of skills than many of them....I feel the only person who can fairly assess what I do here would be my supervisor, Dave Hauser...” (Exhibit A-6)

Supervisor Comments

On the Position Description, Mr. Dave Hauser wrote, “The Maintenance Mech 3 position is critical to the campus during emergencies. There are only two of us on this campus. That means when one of us is gone due to sickness or vacation, there is only one person to deal with the situation. We are the only people with keys to all the buildings and classrooms. We are the only ones who know how to set and silence the alarm systems. In the event of an earthquake for example...we are the ones with the knowledge to know where the main gas and water line shutoffs are to the buildings. We work closely with the fire dept. and police all the time; example: shooter on campus drills.” (Exhibit A-4 and B-4)

On the Position Review Request, Supervisor Portion, Mr. Hauser specifies that Mr. Moen works under general direction and makes decisions without prior review on: “Just about everything except hire/fire, [and] spending that is unusual.” Mr. Hauser also noted, “We have no Mech 3, so there is no choice but for Bruce [Moen] to do Mech 3 level work.”

Mr. Hauser indicates Mr. Moen's percentage of worktime for:

- Grounds (Preventive maintenance...) is 20% rather than 10%, and
- Maintain and repair heating and air conditioning systems...” is 10% rather than 20%. (Exhibits A-3 and B-5)

During the Director's Review conference, Mr. Hauser indicated that he is sometimes out of the office for several months; an average of five or six months' absence annually. Mr. Hauser stated that in his absence, Mr. Moen is responsible to contact the necessary contractors/repair shops to get the work taken care that he cannot complete. For example, fire alarms may need repair; water mains may break and extensive cleanup is needed involving the Fire Dept.; or complicated classroom remodels or roof repairs may be required.

Summary of SVC's Perspective (Exhibit B-2)

Ms. Paula Sheldon completed Mr. Moen's position review. In summarizing the duties of Mr. Moen, Ms. Sheldon made classification and duties comparisons as follows, in part:

Lead and Supervisor. This position does *not* meet the 3 criteria listed below for a lead or supervisory classification:

- The position must be responsible for full scope of Lead or Supervisory duties,
- The position must lead or supervise 1 FTE; and
- The position must perform these duties a majority [51%] of the [work] time.

Utility Worker

Utility Worker series may have been more appropriate, given the variety of semi-skilled manual work. However, the incumbent's position does not assist a journey level worker nor is his position working in support of a team.

Maintenance Mechanic 3

In analyzing the work performed by the incumbent's position, the level of responsibility and the work performed does not meet the definition, scope or intent of the Maintenance Mechanic 3 class specification.

Maintenance Mechanic 1

[This] classification performs semi-skilled and sub journey work in the maintenance, repair, remodeling, alternations and constriction of building, grounds, facilities and equipment. Positions are used as general repairers when it would be impractical to have several journey level tradesperson on site.

Maintenance Mechanic 2

[This class] performs a wide variety of skilled work in the operation, maintenance, repair, remodeling and construction of buildings, grounds, machinery, mechanical facilities and equipment and hospital facilities, systems and equipment. Incumbents work independently and utilize a general knowledge of several related skill fields such as plumbing, electrical, welding, carpentry and machinist work.

Ms. Sheldon's Review Outcome, in part: (Exhibit B-2)

The intent of the class specifications in conjunction with the position review process is to determine the "best fit" for the position. Because this position has responsibilities with both classifications, review of the percentages of time spent on preventive maintenance, repair, remodels, etc., encompasses more than 51% of his [Mr. Moen's] time. ...it is my determination that the position is appropriately allocated to the classification of Maintenance Mechanic 2.

SVC Determination Letter (Exhibit B-1)

Ms. Carolyn Tucker, Executive Director of Human Resources, notified Mr. Moen by letter dated February 23, 2016 that his position was appropriately allocated to the Maintenance Mechanic 2 classification.

Position Review Request (Exhibit A-2 and B-3)

Mr. Moen's Position Review Request was submitted to OFM-State HR on March 9, 2016.

Comparison of Duties to Class specifications

When comparing the assignment of work and level of responsibility to the available class specifications, the Class Series Concept (if one exists) followed by Definition and Distinguishing Characteristics are primary considerations.

Class Series Concept for Maintenance Mechanic

Positions in this series perform general maintenance, repair, remodeling and construction duties utilizing working knowledge of several related skill fields such as electrical, plumbing, carpentry, welding, painting and machinist work. Incumbents inspect, repair, install and maintain physical facilities, locks and maintain and repair machinery and equipment. Positions may be required to lead or supervise and instruct offenders, inmates or residents in general maintenance activities.

Mr. Moen's position's responsibilities are aligned with the intent of this class series concept which is to perform a variety of general maintenance, repair and construction activities requiring a working knowledge of a variety of skill fields. Mr. Moen's position should be allocated within this class series.

Maintenance Mechanic 3 (626L)

Definition

This is the senior, specialist or lead worker level of the series. Positions at this level perform skilled work in more than one trade or craft. Incumbents typically specialize in one trade or craft but perform journey-level and semi-skilled work in a variety of disciplines. Incumbents perform construction, maintenance, repair and modification of buildings, facilities, mechanical equipment, machinery and specific apparatus and utilize a working knowledge of several related skill fields such as plumbing, electrical, welding, carpentry, and machinist work.

The Glossary of Classification Terms is found on the web at:

http://www.hr.wa.gov/sitecollectiondocuments/compensationandjobclasses/comp_class_hr_pro_tools/classificationglossary.doc

The "*Glossary of Classification Terms*" defines "**lead**" as follows:

"Lead. An employee who performs the same or similar duties as other employees in his/her work group and has the designated responsibility to regularly assign, instruct, and check the work of those employees on an ongoing basis."

Mr. Moen may direct the work of one or two temporary employees in maintaining campus grounds during the summer. He also may direct a part-time, work-study student

during the school year. However, Mr. Moen's position does not have designated responsibility to lead the work of others on a regular and ongoing basis. Mr. Moen does not consistently lead a minimum of 1 FTE as required of a lead classification.

The *Glossary of Classification Terms* defines "senior" as:

Senior - The performance of work requiring the consistent application of advanced knowledge and requiring a skilled and experienced practitioner to function independently. Senior-level work includes devising methods and processes to resolve complex or difficult issues that have broad potential impact. These issues typically involve competing interests, multiple clients, conflicting rules or practices, a range of possible solutions, or other elements that contribute to complexity. The senior-level has full authority to plan, prioritize, and handle all duties within an assigned area of responsibility. Senior-level employees require little supervision and their work is not typically checked by others."

The overall scope and complexity of Mr. Moen's assigned duties with respect to his decision making authority do not fully reach senior level responsibility. His work typically does not involve competing interests, multiple clients, conflicting rules or practices, nor a range of possible solutions or other elements that contribute to complexity.

It is understood that Mr. Moen performs skilled trades work. He independently devises methods and processes to resolve issues or situations that arise with respect to his assigned work. His knowledge, skills and experience allow him to independently perform skilled work in installing, maintaining and repairing electrical, mechanical and plumbing systems, heating and air conditioning systems and providing preventive maintenance on a variety of equipment.

However, the work that Mr. Moen performs does not require him to independently devise methods and processes to resolve complex or difficult issues. He is not assigned responsibility for making decisions that carry high consequences of error relative to work orders and other maintenance projects.

Additionally, Mr. Moen's position does not have full senior-level responsibility to plan, prioritize, and handle all duties within his assigned area of responsibility. For example, Mr. Moen does not have responsibility for approving major deviations to his work assignments. He does not have authority to make large or expensive purchases to complete repair work without his supervisor's approval. This limits the level of authority Mr. Moen has to plan, prioritize, and handle all duties within his assigned area of responsibility.

The *Glossary of Classification Terms* defines "specialist" as:

Specialist - Duties involve intensive application of knowledge and skills in a specific segment of an occupational area.

Mr. Moen performs his work in maintenance in response to email work orders. Mr. Moen performs his work under general direction and without specific instruction. In response to work requests, Mr. Moen evaluates the job requirements and the work site, determines the materials and repairs needed to complete the work, and completes the work at the journey level.

The overall scope of Mr. Moen's assigned duties does not require the intensive application of knowledge and skills a majority of his work time to complete his assignments as a specialist as required by this classification. Mr. Moen is not assigned primary responsibilities as a senior, specialist, or lead worker and his position does not meet the allocating requirements of this class. His position should not be reallocated to the Maintenance Mechanic 3 class.

Maintenance Mechanic 2 (626K)

There are no Distinguishing Characteristics for this class. This is the journey, working or occupational level of the series. Positions at this level perform a variety of skilled work in the operation, maintenance, repair, remodeling and construction of buildings, grounds, machinery, mechanical facilities and equipment, and hospital facilities, systems and equipment. Incumbents work independently and utilize a general knowledge of several related skill fields such as plumbing, electrical, welding, carpentry, and machinist work.

The *Glossary of Classification Terms* defines "journey-level" as:

"...Fully competent and qualified in all aspects of a body of work and given broad/general guidance, can complete work assignments to standard under minimal supervision. Also referred to as the working or fully qualified occupational level. "

As described on the PRR, Mr. Moen's duties are consistent with performing journey level work such as maintenance and repair of heating and air conditioning systems in buildings; general maintenance of the fire alarm system, emergency lighting systems and alarm panels. He provides equipment maintenance and repair of electrical, mechanical and plumbing systems. He maintains equipment and completes repairs. He sometimes remodels classrooms and buildings or installs and replaces windows. Mr. Moen is competent and qualified in all aspects of the body of work he performs. He works under general direction and completes his work assignments independently with minimal supervision. Mr. Moen's assigned responsibilities are a match for the anticipated level of work of the Definition of the Maintenance Mechanic 2.

Although the **Typical Work** statements identified in a class specification do not form the basis for an allocation, they lend support to the work envisioned within that class. Additionally, because this class does not contain Distinguishing Characteristics one can look to the Typical Work statements for guidance. The Typical Work statements relevant to Mr. Moen's assigned work include the following, in part:

- Performs preventative maintenance and repairs on all types of mechanical equipment such as electrical drive motors, laundry, ... air-conditioning equipment; ...
- Performs maintenance, operation, and repair of electrical, mechanical and structural systems of buildings and utility distribution;
- Monitor safety, fire protection and environmental control equipment to ensure the building systems and equipment are operating in a satisfactory condition; respond to service request and secure necessary assistance; take preventative and emergency action to control malfunctions;
- Installs, maintains, and repairs electrical connections, switches, circuits, electrical equipment, thermostats, and valves.

Mr. Moen's duties are fully consistent with the Definition and the Typical Work statements and the overall description of the Maintenance Mechanic 2 classification.

For example, Mr. Moen is responsible for performing skilled maintenance and repair work. He assists with electrical and other skilled trades work and maintains the fire alarm systems. He helps resolve electrical problems and plumbing leaks. He ensures the air conditioning works correctly to keep classrooms cool. He provides direction to temporary and part-time employees in grounds maintenance tasks. He is responsible for locking and unlocking entry doors and ensures the lights are turned on and off. He provides maintenance at other remote campus locations. The majority of his duties involve performing journey-level assignments within established standards and guidelines and without specific instruction.

Most positions within the civil service system occasionally perform duties that appear in more than one classification. However, when determining the appropriate classification for a specific position, the duties and responsibilities of that position must be considered in their entirety and Director's Determination for the position must be allocated to the classification that provides the best fit overall for the majority of the position's duties and responsibilities. See *Dudley v. Dept. of Labor and Industries*, PRB Case No. R-ALLO-07-007 (2007).

It is very clear that Mr. Moen is a valued employee. However, a position's allocation is not based on an evaluation of performance or an individual's ability to perform higher-level work. Rather, it is based on the majority of work assigned to a position and how that work best aligns with the available job classes.

Based on the primary focus of Mr. Moen's position and comparison of his assigned duties and responsibilities to the relevant job classes, his position is accurately aligned with the requirements of the MM 2 class. Mr. Moen's position is appropriately allocated to the Maintenance Mechanic 2 class.

Appeal Rights

RCW 41.06.170 governs the right to appeal. RCW 41.06.170(4) provides, in relevant part, the following:

An employee incumbent in a position at the time of its allocation or reallocation, or the agency utilizing the position, may appeal the allocation or reallocation to the Washington personnel resources board. Notice of such appeal must be filed in writing within thirty days of the action from which appeal is taken.

The mailing address for the Personnel Resources Board (PRB) is PO Box 40911, Olympia, Washington, 98504-0911. The PRB Office is located on the 3rd floor of the Raad Building, 128 10th Avenue SW, Olympia, Washington. The main telephone number is (360) 407-4101, and the fax number is (360) 586-4694.

If no further action is taken, the Director's determination becomes final.

c: Carolyn Tucker, Executive Director of Human Resources, SVC
Helen Kane, Human Resource Consultant, SVC

Enclosure: List of Exhibits

LIST OF EXHIBITS

A. Bruce Moen Exhibits

1. Director's Review Form received May 9, 2016
2. Position Review Request – Employee Portion
3. Position Review Request – Supervisor Portion
4. Position Description Form
5. Mr. Moen's argument for upgrade
6. Rebuttal of denial of upgrade

B. Skagit Valley College Exhibits

1. Allocation Determination Letter
2. Position Review Analysis
3. Position Review Request
4. Position Description Form
5. Position Review Request Supervisor Portion
6. Hourly and Student Hours Worked
7. Whidbey Campus Organizational Chart
8. Mt. Vernon Campus and Whidbey Island Campus Maps
9. Whidbey Island Campus Maintenance Custodian II
10. Skagit Valley College – Maintenance Mechanic 2 Promotional Announcement
11. Skagit Valley College – Maintenance Mechanic 3 Announcement
12. State of WA Class Specification – Maintenance Mechanic 1
13. State of WA Class Specification – Maintenance Mechanic 2
14. State of WA Class Specification – Maintenance Mechanic 3
15. State of WA Class Specification – Maintenance Technician 1
16. State of WA Class Specification – Utility Worker 1
17. State of WA Class Specification – Utility Worker 2
18. State of WA Class Specification – Utility Worker 3

C. Class Specifications

1. Maintenance Mechanic 1 for Class Series Concept
2. Maintenance Mechanic 2
3. Maintenance Mechanic 3
4. Maintenance Technician 1
5. Utility Worker 1
6. Utility Worker 2
7. Utility Worker 3