

TO: Teresa Parsons, SPHR  
Director's Review Program Supervisor

FROM: Kris Brophy, SPHR  
Director's Review Investigator

SUBJECT: Salvador Castro v. Bellevue Community College (BCC)  
Allocation Review Request ALLO-10-005

### **Director's Determination**

This position review was based on the work performed for the six-month period prior to October 29, 2009, the date BCC Human Resources received the request for a position review. As the Director's Review Investigator, I carefully considered all of the documentation in the file, the exhibits, and the verbal comments provided by both parties during the review conference. Based on my review and analysis of Mr. Castro's assigned duties and responsibilities, I conclude his position is properly allocated to the Grounds and Nursery Specialist 3 classification.

### **Background**

On October 29, 2009, BCC Human Resources received Mr. Castro's Position Review Request form (PRR), requesting his Grounds & Nursery Services Specialist 3 (GNSS 3) position be reallocated to Grounds & Nursery Services Specialist 4 (GNSS 4). The PRR was completed by his Supervisor Teri Eidson; Ground Manager, on October 27; and signed by Mr. Castro on October 28, 2009 (Exhibit B-2).

On December 31, 2009, Ms. Lucy Macneil, Special Assistant to VP HR, notified Mr. Castro that his position was properly allocated as a GNSS 3. Ms. Macneil concluded the majority of duties assigned to the position met the GNSS 3 classification (Exhibit B-1).

On January 26, 2010, the Department of Personnel (DOP) received his request for a Director's review of BCC's allocation decision (Exhibit A-1).

On August 18, 2010, I conducted a Director's review conference regarding the position allocation of Salvador Castro. Present during the call were Salvador Castro; Robin Ledbetter, Council Representative, WFSE; Lucy Macneil; and Penni Blakely, Vice President of HR.

### **Rationale for Director's Determination**

The purpose of a position review is to determine which classification best describes the overall duties and responsibilities of a position. A position review is neither a measurement of the volume of work performed, nor an evaluation of the expertise with which that work is performed. A position review is a comparison of the duties and responsibilities of a particular position to the available classification specifications. This review results in a determination of the class that best describes the overall duties and responsibilities of the position. Liddle-Stamper v. Washington State University, PAB Case No. 3722-A2 (1994).

### **Duties and Responsibilities**

I reviewed the Position Description form (PRR) completed by his supervisor and signed by Mr. Castro on October 28, 2009 (Exhibit B-2).

Mr. Castro's position is located in the Campus Operations/Grounds Department at BCC. His position exists to help the College create a welcoming environment for students, staff, faculty and the community by leading grounds maintenance staff involved in performing various grounds keeping activities on the BCC campus. Mr. Castro's duties include maintaining lawns, sweeping roadways, eradicating noxious weeds, controlling pests, and eliminating grounds hazards to pedestrians and motorists. Mr. Castro works with his supervisor to plan, schedule and perform various seasonal grounds maintenance projects and tasks on campus. He reports to Ms. Teri Eidson, Grounds Manager.

In the position description form (PRR) submitted for reallocation, Mr. Castro describes his duties as follows (summarized from Exhibit B-2):

- 35% Supervise permanent and temporary employees, including training and mentoring and maintaining adherence to safety policies and procedures.
- 30% Operate power and motorized equipment; front-end loaders, forklift, chain saws, commercial lawn mowers, and other grounds equipment.
- 25% Coordinate, plan and prepare grounds tasks with supervisor.
- 10% Submit requests for supplies and equipment needs and/or repairs.

### **Summary of Mr. Castro's Perspective**

Mr. Castro asserts his position involves handling more duties than before with the grounds department and crew. He asserts he coordinates work with his supervisor on a higher level than anticipated by the GNS 3 class. He asserts he works with his supervisor to plan and coordinate various seasonal projects throughout the year. Mr. Castro stated during the review telephone conference that he works with his supervisor to develop and schedule quarterly grounds maintenance plans for the unit. He asserts his responsibilities for planning and preparing for projects, which includes coordinating projects with other staff on

campus such as campus security and facilities staff, demonstrates his skills in performing higher level work and reaches the G&NSS 4 level of responsibility.

### Summary of BCC's Reasoning

Ms. Macneil asserts the GNS 4 class presumes a level of autonomy and involvement in developing annual operating plans, preparing special landscape projects, and determining annual expenditures. Ms. Macneil contends these duties are performed by Ms. Eidson, Mr. Castro's supervisor.

### Comparison of Duties to Class Specifications

When comparing the assignment of work and level of responsibility to the available class specifications, the class series concept (if one exists) followed by definition and distinguishing characteristics are primary considerations. While examples of typical work identified in a class specification do not form the basis for an allocation, they lend support to the work envisioned within a classification.

Additionally, most positions within the civil service system occasionally perform duties that appear in more than one classification. However, when determining the appropriate classification for a specific position, the duties and responsibilities of that position must be considered in their entirety and the position must be allocated to the classification that provides the best fit overall for the majority of the position's duties and responsibilities. Dudley v. Dept. of Labor and Industries, PRB Case No. R-ALLO-07-007 (2007).

### Comparison of Duties to the Grounds and Nursery Services Specialist series

The Class Series Concept for this series state:

Positions in this occupational category are responsible for the maintenance of grounds, landscapes, athletic fields, nurseries and/or greenhouses, performing various maintenance types of operations. Positions may be involved in litter control, recycling activities, and sprinkler irrigation/maintenance within a grounds maintenance program.

Mr. Castro performs various grounds maintenance activities for the BCC campus. His position fits within the class series concept and should be allocated to a class within this series.

The Definition for Grounds and Nursery Specialist 3 states:

Positions in this level perform multiple duties relating to the care and maintenance of grounds, greenhouses, nurseries, or gardening programs. Positions may be involved in working with a crew of juveniles or young adults focusing on litter control,

recycling activities, and distributing program-related materials at special events; educating youth crews in the environmental ethics of recycling and litter control. Positions may be involved in sprinkler irrigation and the maintenance of a grounds maintenance program. Positions may also manage a small gardening program or a major division in a large gardening program. Propagates and cares for trees, shrubs, and forage plants. Performs soil analysis, receives and ships plants, maintains growth records on propagations.

There are no Distinguishing Characteristics for this class.

The Definition for Grounds and Nursery Services Specialist 4 states:

Positions in this level may lead or supervise assigned personnel in the development and maintenance of grounds, landscapes, athletic fields, nurseries and/or greenhouses. Assigns, instructs and checks the work of other grounds personnel in landscape construction and grounds maintenance work. Positions may manage and participate in planning large gardening and grounds maintenance programs.  
[Emphasis added]

There are no Distinguishing Characteristics for this class.

There is significant overlap between the GNSS 3 and 4 level classes. The GNSS 3 class describes positions which perform multiple duties related to the care and maintenance of grounds. This class may supervise, direct, or lead other employees and helpers.

The GNSS 4 level class describes positions which assign, instruct, and check the work of assigned personnel involved with grounds maintenance work and landscape construction. This requires incumbents to lead and perform both landscape construction and grounds maintenance work. It also permissively denotes a higher level responsibility for managing and participating in planning large grounds and grounds maintenance programs, formulating and submitting for administrative approval annual operating plans for large grounds programs, submitting requests for supplies, equipment and help when needed, and assisting in interviewing, selecting, training, and evaluating personnel.

#### Comparison of Duties to Grounds and Nursery Services Specialist 4

Mr. Castro's position does not fully reach the overall level of responsibility required at the GNSS 4 level. It is undisputed that Mr. Castro leads assigned personnel in the maintenance of grounds, landscapes, and athletic fields for the BCC campus. Mr. Castro states in the PRR that his supervisor relies on him to lead the crew in their daily tasks, including prioritizing their work and reporting to her daily regarding the status of work assignments and projects. However, from the information presented, Mr. Castro's duties involve leading and performing grounds maintenance work. The special landscaping projects he assists his supervisor to plan and complete throughout the year (including clearing and manually programming the College's irrigation system, cleaning the campus's 10,000 gallon fountain,

pressure washing stairs and ramps, conducting lawn and athletic turf maintenance, street sweeping, and completing tree limbing projects and other projects) are maintenance related. However, from the information and examples of work presented, his duties do not involve landscape construction work.

Although the Typical Work examples do not form the basis for an allocation, they lend support to the work envisioned within a classification. The following provides an example of the level of work assigned to the Grounds and Nursery Services Specialist 4 class, as stated in the class specification:

Coordinates, plans and prepares special landscaping projects;

Formulates and submits for administrative approval annual operating plans for large program, of grounds maintenance, gardening, and greenhouse operation;

Submits requests for supplies, equipment and help needed;

It is also undisputed that Mr. Castro assists his supervisor in scheduling and preparing for seasonal landscape maintenance projects. His role involves working with his supervisor to schedule the appropriate time to complete the project, and to contact and coordinate activities with facilities and security staff. However, as the definition and typical work statements illustrate, the GNSS 4 class denotes a higher level of responsibility for managing and participating in planning large landscape programs, formulating and submitting for administrative approval annual operating plans for large grounds programs, and assisting in interviewing, selecting, training, and evaluating personnel. These higher level responsibilities are performed by his supervisor, Ms. Eidson. His duties are best described as assisting his supervisor in developing project timelines and schedules for seasonal landscape maintenance projects.

Mr. Castro does have limited authority to order parts and supplies during the course of regular maintenance activities, and for landscape maintenance projects when his supervisor is unavailable. Mr. Castro also provides daily direction and reviews the work of the crew and reports on staff performance to his supervisor for evaluation purposes. He also has authority to assign and reassign daily work depending on priorities, safety, and other factors.

In total, Mr. Castro's position does not fully meet the requirements of the Definition for this class for performing and leading the work of assigned personnel in landscape construction projects. For this reason, his position should not be allocated to the Grounds and Nursery Services Specialist 4 class.

### Comparison of Duties to Grounds and Nursery Services Specialist 3

The Definition for this class states in part that positions, "... perform multiple duties relating to the care and maintenance of grounds, greenhouses, nurseries, or gardening programs..." Mr. Castro's duties are best described as leading assigned staff and performing multiple

duties relating to the care and maintenance of the BCC campus. The overall scope and level of responsibility of his position more closely matches the Definition for this class. Mr. Castro's position is involved in sprinkler irrigation and the maintenance of a grounds maintenance program.

In *Salsberry v. Washington State Parks and Recreation Commission*, PRB Case No. R-ALLO-06-013 (2007), the Personnel Resources Board addressed the concept of best fit. The Board referenced *Allegri v. Washington State University*, PAB Case No. ALLO-96-0026 (1998), in which the Personnel Appeals Board noted that while the appellant's duties and responsibilities did not encompass the full breadth of the duties and responsibilities described by the classification to which his position was allocated, on a best fit basis, the classification best described the level, scope and diversity of the overall duties and responsibilities of his position.

Mr. Castro's allocation is not a measurement of his performance. A position's allocation, however, is limited to the duties and responsibilities assigned and how the majority of those duties best fit into the available job classifications. During the period of time under this review, while a portion of his work exceeds the requirements of this class, the majority of his work assignments are more closely aligned with the requirements of the GNSS 3 class. Therefore, the Grounds and Nursery Services Specialist 3 classification best describes the overall scope and level of responsibility of his position.

### **Appeal Rights**

RCW 41.06.170 governs the right to appeal. RCW 41.06.170(4) provides, in relevant part, the following:

An employee incumbent in a position at the time of its allocation or reallocation, or the agency utilizing the position, may appeal the allocation or reallocation to . . . the Washington personnel resources board . . . . Notice of such appeal must be filed in writing within thirty days of the action from which appeal is taken.

The mailing address for the Personnel Resources Board (PRB) is P.O. Box 40911, Olympia, Washington, 98504-0911. The PRB Office is located at 600 South Franklin, Olympia, Washington. The main telephone number is (360) 664-0388, and the fax number is (360) 753-0139.

If no further action is taken, the Director's determination becomes final.

c: Salvador Castro, BCC  
Penni Blakely, BCC  
Lisa Skriletz, DOP

Enclosure: List of Exhibits

## **Salvador Castro v. Bellevue Community College ALLO-10-005**

### List of Exhibits

#### **A. Salvador Castro Exhibits**

1. Request for Director's Review from Salvador Castro, received January 26, 2010.
2. Letter of appeal for Director's Review on behalf of Salvador Castro from Ms. Teri Eidson, dated January 11, 2010 and received January 20, 2010. (Note: this was submitted on Mr. Castro's behalf but could not be used as the appeal letter.)
3. Copy of the position allocation review determination email from Lucy Macneil to Salvador Castro, dated December 31, 2009.
4. Position Review Request form submitted to HR (copy with no signatures or dates).
5. Cover sheet of additional exhibits:
  - a. March 26, 2010 letter from Teri Eidson to Robin Ledbetter regarding Salvador Castro's job duties.
  - b. March 26, 2010 letter from Salvador Castro to Robin Ledbetter regarding Salvador Castro's job duties.

#### **B. Bellevue College Exhibits**

1. Position Review determination email from Lucy Macneil to Salvador Castro, dated December 31, 2009.
2. Position Review Request for Salvador Castro, dated October 29, 2009 (with date and signatures)
3. Organization Chart for Campus Operations division.

#### **C. Class Specifications**

1. Class Specification: Grounds and Nursery Services Specialist 2 (591J)
2. Class Specification: Grounds and Nursery Services Specialist 3 (591K)
3. Class Specification: Grounds and Nursery Services Specialist 4 (591L)