



STATE OF WASHINGTON
OFFICE OF THE STATE HUMAN RESOURCES DIRECTOR

DIRECTOR'S REVIEW PROGRAM
521 Capitol Way South, P.O. Box 40911, Olympia, WA 98504-0911
(360) 664-0388 · FAX (360) 586-4694

April 11, 2012

TO: Kandys Dygert, Council Representative
Washington Federation of State Employees (WFSE)

FROM: Teresa Parsons, SPHR
Director's Review Program Supervisor

SUBJECT: Thomas Koehler v. Washington State University (WSU)
Allocation Review Request ALLO-11-029

On February 1 and March 22, 2012, I conducted a Director's review telephone conference regarding the allocation of Thomas Koehler's position. In addition to you and Mr. Koehler, Gerry Stamper, WFSE Shop Steward, participated in the conference. Mr. Koehler's supervisor, Maintenance Specialist 4 Tom Burritt, also participated on the first day of the conference. Kendra Wilkins-Fontenot, Assistant Director of Human Resource Services, represented WSU. Rob Corcoran, Director of Maintenance Utilities & Construction Services, also participated in the conference.

Director's Determination

This position review was based on the work performed for the six-month period prior to December 15, 2010, the date Mr. Koehler submitted his request for a position review to WSU's Human Resource Services (HRS). As the Director's designee, I carefully considered all of the documentation in the file, the exhibits presented during the Director's review conference, and the verbal comments provided by both parties. Based on my review and analysis of Mr. Koehler's assigned duties and responsibilities, I conclude his position is properly allocated to the Locksmith classification.

Background

Mr. Koehler's position is assigned to Maintenance Services at WSU. When Mr. Koehler began his position with WSU about six years ago, he initially reported to a Locksmith Supervisor, Mike Blair. Mr. Blair's position is located in a separate location on campus in the "lock shop." However, Mr. Koehler indicated that about six months after he began working with Mr. Blair, he moved to the "carpenter shop" and no longer reported to Mr. Blair. At the time relevant to this review, Mr. Koehler reported to Tom Burritt, Maintenance Mechanic 4 (Exhibit A-8-1). Mr. Koehler stated that his position has been assigned to work from the "carpenter shop" for the past several years. He included a number of organizational charts to show changes in the organizational structure within the Plant Maintenance & Repair Section (Exhibits A-6 and A-8, 1-3). Within that section, Mike Beaudry, Maintenance Mechanic 3, will often serve in a lead role. The Maintenance Mechanic 3, Maintenance Mechanic 2s, Locksmith Supervisor and Locksmith

positions all report to Mr. Burrit, who reports to the Maintenance and Utilities Services Director, Mr. Corcoran.

On December 15, 2010, HRS received a Position Review Request form (PRR) from Mr. Koehler, requesting that his Locksmith position be reallocated to the Maintenance Mechanic 2 job class (Exhibit A-3). On June 14, 2011, WSU provided the Results of Employee Requested Classification Review, concluding Mr. Koehler's position best fit the Locksmith class. Specifically, WSU determined his primary job functions revolved around locksmith duties that included installing, inspecting, maintaining, and repairing locking devices (Exhibit B-1).

On June 22, 2011, the Department of Personnel received Mr. Koehler's request for a Director's review of WSU's allocation determination.

Summary of Mr. Koehler's Perspective

Mr. Koehler contends the majority of his work extends beyond locksmith work and that he often performs carpentry and other maintenance work in addition to repairing locks and locking devices. For example, Mr. Koehler states that his position may be required to repair and sand a door, fix hinges, add weather stripping, repair transitional flooring, and patch drywall, which he describes as carpentry work. In addition, he indicates his position works on overhead rollup doors and may need to perform work with sheet metal or troubleshoot and repair spring loaded mechanical devices and electrical motors and switches. While Mr. Koehler agrees he performs some locksmith work, he emphasizes his position is assigned to a shop with other Maintenance Mechanics and that he does not report to or work directly with the Locksmith Supervisor position. Overall, Mr. Koehler asserts his position is a better fit for the Maintenance Mechanic 2 classification.

Summary of WSU's Reasoning

WSU asserts the primary function of Mr. Koehler's position is to perform journey level work installing, inspecting, maintaining, and repairing locks and locking devices, as well as all types of doors and window hardware. WSU acknowledges some of the work assigned to Mr. Koehler's position falls outside the scope of the Locksmith class but contends the majority of his work fits within this classification. WSU asserts his duties involving the repair of electronic devices, door openings, electronic pads, and gates, all fit within the duties described in the Locksmith job classification.

Rationale for Director's Determination

The purpose of a position review is to determine which classification best describes the overall duties and responsibilities of a position. A position review is neither a measurement of the volume of work performed, nor an evaluation of the expertise with which that work is performed. A position review is a comparison of the duties and responsibilities of a particular position to the available classification specifications. This review results in a determination of the class that best describes the overall duties and responsibilities of the position. Liddle-Stamper v. Washington State University, PAB Case No. 3722-A2 (1994).

Duties and Responsibilities

On the Position Review Request (PRR) form, Mr. Koehler describes his position's purpose as follows:

The primary purpose of my position is to apply technical experience and knowledge of building maintenance and life safety codes that will insure a safe learning and working environment for the students, faculty and staff at WSU. These goals are achieved with general direction from my supervisor, by insuring that equipment and buildings are safe and structurally sound and that all means of ingress and egress are in compliance with federal, state, and local guidelines. Secondly my positing is responsible for the security of the building, occupants, and equipment housed on the WSU campus and satellite facilities either by routine or emergency maintenance, repairs, and installation of electronic and mechanical access controls, and security devices.

Mr. Koehler's job duties are broken down as follows from the highest to lowest percentages listed on the PRR (Exhibit A-3):

- 35% Install, maintain, and repair doors, locks, exit devices, door closers and other related finish hardware.
- 20% Install, maintain and repair Handicap/automatic entrances, power operated overhead doors, operable partitions and motorized gates.
- 15% Install, maintain and repair building interiors such as drywall, patch and paint, toilet partitions, ceiling tiles, flooring, signage and office furniture.
- 15% Maintain, repair or replace building exteriors such as soffit/facia, hand rails & protective barriers, roof hatches, windows, glass, bug screens and fencing.
- 15% Cover emergencies and shop responsibilities for the WSU Locksmith Supervisor every Friday from 6am to 4:30 pm.

In addition, WSU provided a report of Mr. Koehler's time card hours (Exhibit B-6), and he provided a sample of work orders he believed to be outside the scope of locksmith work (Exhibit A-8-4). During the Director's review conferences, we went through each of the work orders to gain a better perspective of the work involved. In summary, WSU agreed the following functions fit outside the Locksmith class: replacing glass; bolting a ladder to a wall; performing soffit repair; operating a manlift; repairing hand rails and stair rails; repairing area around elevator doors; concrete or masonry work; specific work at the stadium complex; repairing signage; ceiling repairs; furniture repairs; and replacing steam valves. (These functions are identified in Exhibit A-8-4 on the following pages: 1, 2, 3, 10, 17, 21, 23, 32, 41, 49, 62, 73, 86, and 90).

WSU maintains that any work relating to the maintenance and repair of locking devices, doors, opening devices, and door systems (electrical or mechanical) fit within the Locksmith definition. The Director of Maintenance, Mr. Corcoran, indicates the primary focus of Mr. Koehler's duties involves locksmith work with the performance of some other maintenance work as needed. Mr. Koehler disagrees and asserts that his work on large, heavy rollup doors and partitions with electronic switches, key pads, and mechanical devices does not fit the category of locksmith work.

Class Specifications

When comparing the assignment of work and level of responsibility to the available class specifications, the class series concept (if one exists) followed by definition and distinguishing

characteristics are primary considerations. While examples of typical work identified in a class specification do not form the basis for an allocation, they lend support to the work envisioned within a classification.

The **Maintenance Mechanic** class series concept reads as follows:

Positions in this series perform general maintenance, repair, remodeling and construction duties utilizing working knowledge of several related skill fields such as electrical, plumbing, carpentry, welding, painting and machinist work. Incumbents inspect, repair, install and maintain physical facilities, locks and maintain and repair machinery and equipment. Positions may be required to lead or supervise and instruct offenders, inmates or residents in general maintenance activities.

The **Maintenance Mechanic 2** definition states the following:

This is the journey, working or occupational level of the series. Positions at this level perform a variety of skilled work in the operation, maintenance, repair, remodeling and construction of buildings, grounds, machinery, mechanical facilities and equipment, and hospital facilities, systems and equipment. Incumbents work independently and utilize a general knowledge of several related skill fields such as plumbing, electrical, welding, carpentry, and machinist work.

I recognize some of the maintenance tasks you perform are included in the Maintenance Mechanic job classes and typical work examples, such as repairing doors and windows. In a broader context, an assignment to maintain and repair locks as part of general maintenance duties and responsibilities may fit into the Maintenance Mechanic classes. However, the primary focus of your position includes maintenance, repairs, and installation of electronic and mechanical access controls, security devices, and door entrances and exits on campus. Further, the majority of work described on the PRR includes installing, maintaining, and repairing doors, locks, and other related hardware 55% of the time.

The Locksmith definition states that positions function as "fully qualified journey-level" locksmiths performing "a variety of duties in skilled locking systems repair and installation work." Further, the typical work identified in the Locksmith job class includes the following:

- Repairs malfunctioning locks; re-keys locks to improve building security;
- Straightens, repairs, installs and otherwise services hinges and panic locking and unlocking devices; maintains and repairs fire doors, door closures, door jams;
- Uses and maintains hand and power tools such as lock picks, drills, wood chisels, metal grinders, etc.; operates key duplicating machines, drill press, grinders, and other power and hand tools required for accomplishing work;
- Repairs electric door opening/locking devices including touch-pad entry system.

I realize there is some overlap between the duties described in the Maintenance Mechanic classes and the Locksmith class.

The Personnel Resources Board (PRB) has previously addressed similar issues when duties appear to fit in more than one class. The PRB concluded that while one class appeared to

cover the scope of a position, there was another classification that not only encompassed the scope of the position, but specifically encompassed the unique functions performed. Alvarez v. Olympic College, PRB No. R-ALLO-08-013 (2008). Further, the Board has consistently held that "[w]hen there is a definition that specifically includes a particular assignment and there is a general classification that has a definition which could also apply to the position, the position will be allocated to the class with the definition that includes the position" Mikitik v Depts. of Wildlife and Personnel, PAB No. A88-021 (1989).

Mr. Koehler's position has been tasked with performing skilled locksmith work in addition to other maintenance functions as needed. However, the majority of work described on the PRR includes installing, maintaining, and repairing doors, locks, exit devices, door closers and other related hardware, including handicap/automatic entrances, power operated overhead doors, operable partitions, and motorized gates. This is further supported by the Position Description for Mr. Koehler's position, which describes, in part, duties to maintain, repair, install and service all types of locking devices, vehicle locks, vault and safe security equipment, including computerized locking systems (Exhibit B-2). These functions specifically align with the work described in the Locksmith class specification.

Therefore, the Locksmith classification better encompasses the primary focus of Mr. Koehler's position and the majority of his duties and responsibilities as a whole.

Appeal Rights

RCW 41.06.170 governs the right to appeal. RCW 41.06.170(4) provides, in relevant part, the following:

An employee incumbent in a position at the time of its allocation or reallocation, or the agency utilizing the position, may appeal the allocation or reallocation to . . . the Washington personnel resources board Notice of such appeal must be filed in writing within thirty days of the action from which appeal is taken.

The mailing address for the Personnel Resources Board (PRB) is P.O. Box 40911, Olympia, Washington, 98504-0911. The PRB Office is located at 521 Capitol Way South, Olympia, Washington. The main telephone number is (360) 664-0388, and the fax number is (360) 586-4694.

If no further action is taken, the Director's determination becomes final.

c: Thomas Koehler
Kendra Wilkins-Fontenot, WSU
Lisa Skriletz, OSHRD

Enclosure: List of Exhibits

THOMAS KOEHLER v WSU
ALLO-11-029

A. Thomas Koehler Exhibits

1. Director's Review Request received June 22, 2011 (page 1-3)
2. WSU allocation determination letter dated June 14, 2011 (page 1-2)
3. Position Review Request received WSU HR December 15, 2010 (page 1-6)
4. Position Description submitted to WSU HR for reallocation, signed by Thomas Koehler, immediate supervisor and 2nd line supervisor (page 1-2)
5. Position Questionnaire submitted to WSU HR for reallocation, signed by Thomas Koehler, immediate supervisor and 2nd line supervisor (page 1-2)
6. Maintenance Services Organizational Chart September 7, 2010 (1 page)
7. 2009 Position Description for Thomas Koehler (page 1-9)
8. July 28, 2011 exhibit submission letter from Thomas Koehler with exhibits:
 - 1) Maintenance Services organizational chart November 5, 2010
 - 2) Maintenance Services organizational chart May 3, 2011
 - 3) Maintenance Services organizational chart November 5, 2010, reposted to website July 2011
 - 4) Fac Ops work orders for June 15 through December 15, 2010 (page 1-92)

B. WSU Exhibits

1. WSU allocation determination letter dated June 14, 2011 (page 1-2)
2. Current Position Description (electronic copy) (page 1-9)
3. Locksmith Classification specification (1 page)
4. Maintenance Mechanic 1 Classification specification (1 page)
5. Maintenance Mechanic 2 Classification specification (1 page)
6. Work Request Report for June 15 through December 15, 2010 (page 1-6)
7. Examples of work orders included in Exhibit A-8-4 above that WSU agrees are outside Locksmith class.