



STATE OF WASHINGTON
OFFICE OF FINANCIAL MANAGEMENT

STATE HUMAN RESOURCES DIVISION | DIRECTOR'S REVIEW PROGRAM
P.O. Box 40911 · Olympia, WA 98504-0911 · (360) 902-9820 · FAX (360) 586-4694

June 11, 2013

TO: Andrew Caveness

FROM: Teresa Parsons, SPHR
Director's Review Program Supervisor

SUBJECT: Andrew Caveness v. Central Washington University (CWU)
Allocation Review Request ALLO-12-050

On April 10, 2013, I conducted a Director's review telephone conference regarding the allocation of your position. You and Human Resource (HR) Representative Stephen Sarchet participated in the conference.

Director's Determination

This position review was based on a management-initiated request that resulted in the reallocation of your position from the Food Service Supervisor 2 job class to the Program Support Supervisor 1 job class. As the Director's designee, I carefully considered all of the documentation in the file, the exhibits presented during the Director's review conference, and the verbal comments provided by both parties. Based on my review and analysis of your assigned duties and responsibilities, I conclude your position is properly allocated to the Program Support Supervisor 1 classification.

Background

You began your position in 2007 as a Food Service Supervisor 2, located in the Dining Services Department within Finance and Auxiliary Services. You report to Food Service Manager 4 Laurie Wirt, who reports to the Dining Services Director, Daniel Layman (Exhibit B-5). In October 2010, your Position Description Form (PDF) had been updated to reflect your responsibilities of supervising the day-to-day operations of a campus convenience store and four espresso bars, including supervision of a Snack Bar Lead position and student employees.

In September 2012, you assumed responsibility for overseeing the day-to-day operations of the Connection Card program, in addition to the campus convenience store and espresso bars. In

anticipation of your added duties and responsibilities, Mr. Layman completed a CWU Position Description Worksheet and asked that your position be reallocated.

Mr. Sarchet reviewed the CWU Position Description Worksheet, and on August 16, 2012, he notified you that your position had been reallocated to the Program Support Supervisor 1 classification (Exhibit A-3).

On September 6, 2012, the Office of the State Human Resources Director (OSHRD) received your request for a Director's review of CWU's allocation determination.

The following summarizes your perspective as well as CWU's rationale for the University's decision.

Summary of Mr. Caveness's Perspective

Mr. Caveness asserts his duties in Dining Services have expanded since 2007 when he was in charge of one convenience store, two espresso stands, and roughly 35 student employees. Since that time, Mr. Caveness explains that his position assumed responsibility for two more espresso stands (five locations total) and about 50 student employees in addition to two full-time classified staff. For these locations, Mr. Caveness asserts he manages all operations, including scheduling and supervising staff, meeting with vendors, ordering merchandise and deciding what to bring in as well as phase out, and completing inventory for food and convenience store stock. Further, he asserts he projects and monitors sales revenue and expenses to ensure he stays within the allotted budget. In addition, Mr. Caveness contends he programs and audits the cash register Point of Sale (POS) system for all of Dining Services, including updating and making price changes, ensuring accuracy, designing screen layout and button placement, running product movement reports, and creating key templates.

Mr. Caveness's position also assumed total responsibility for managing the Connection Card program, which manages the meal plans and debit accounts for student identification cards. Mr. Caveness indicates the system also maintains staff and faculty badges, as well as visitor or media badges, in which money can be added for meals. He indicates he also works with Education Services on connection cards for study abroad programs. In addition, Mr. Caveness asserts that he maintains the Connection Card website, including updates and changes and that he helps market materials and provides information at student orientations. Mr. Caveness states he reports directly to the Director of Dining Services, Mr. Layman, for the Connection Card program and he attends meetings in the Director's absence.

Mr. Caveness also supervises student employees who work in the Connection Card office, and he monitors and audits all employee time in the Kronos (timecard) program before submitting to payroll. Mr. Caveness states that he works with the accounting/fiscal department as needed to resolve issues related to the stores or the Connection Card office. Overall, Mr. Caveness contends his duties have increased in scope and level of responsibility, and he points out that the operations he manages generate half of the entire income of Dining Services. In addition, he contends other positions allocated to the Program Support Supervisor classes generally have responsibility for one program area and that he has multiple areas of responsibility. For these reasons, Mr. Caveness contends his position should be reallocated to a higher-level classification, such as the Food Service Manager 3 or Program Manager B, to reflect the increase in duties and level of responsibility.

Summary of CWU's Reasoning

CWU recognizes an increased level of responsibility with the assignment of the Connection Card office. In reviewing Mr. Caveness's duties and responsibilities in total, CWU determined allocation to the Program classes provided a better fit since his position does not deal with food preparation the majority of the time. In reviewing the Program classes, CWU asserts Mr. Caveness's duties and responsibilities do not rise to the level described in the Program Manager A and B classes. In particular, CWU contends Mr. Caveness's position has not been assigned the level of budget responsibility indicative of the Program Manager classes and asserts that major program changes are discussed with the Director of Dining Services. At the time of review, CWU contends the overall duties and responsibilities best aligned with the Program Support Supervisor 1 classification.

Rationale for Director's Determination

The purpose of a position review is to determine which classification best describes the overall duties and responsibilities of a position. A position review is neither a measurement of the volume of work performed, nor an evaluation of the expertise with which that work is performed. A position review is a comparison of the duties and responsibilities of a particular position to the available classification specifications. This review results in a determination of the class that best describes the overall duties and responsibilities of the position. Liddle-Stamper v. Washington State University, PAB Case No. 3722-A2 (1994).

Duties and Responsibilities

The CWU Position Description Worksheet used to reallocate Mr. Caveness's position describes the job summary as follows (Exhibit B-2):

Under general direction, this position is responsible for managing the day-to-day operations of the Connection Card program, campus convenience store and espresso bars including directing and supervising assigned staff.

In summary, the duties have been described as follows (Exhibit B-2):

Connection Card Office (35%)

- Oversees the meal plans and debit accounts and promotes the program to campus departments. Supervise student clerical staff that assist in running the Connection Card ID center. Establish and promote customer service standards and coordinate data and report processes with other Dining Services and Enterprise Accounting departments.
- Set goals for the growth and development of the Connection Card program and work with campus departments and potential outside vendors to develop new uses for the program. Establish new locations for the Connection Card program and implement procedures to ensure that all locations are operated properly.
- Function as a primary liaison between unit and other units/departments, ensuring that other areas are advised of changes, new procedures/policies and current information and primary contact with program participants.

- Assists with the development and production of marketing and informational materials [work with housing and marketing].
- Establish, maintain and initiate procedures, including processing and control of cash receipts and use of the on-line debit card system and system security.
- Take an active role in improving customer service and respond to customer inquiries and complaints.
- Maintain positive and efficient work environment and manage staff resources and project planning, prioritizing and scheduling.
- Develop, establish and modify computerized record-keeping systems, filing systems, and data base files.
- Develop and maintain the Connection Card budget. Periodic reviews to ensure the operations remain within established budgetary guidelines.
- Establish and revise filing systems and data base files and Central Connection Card operations.
- Oversee the daily reconciliation of the debit card system.
- Coordinate with Auxiliary Services Computing regarding system diagnostics and maintenance for hardware, software and system upgrades.
- Initiate charge/credit forms to change customer dining and general debit accounts.
- Document and balance remaining debt account balances daily.
- Supervise the issuing of new and replacement Connection Cards.
- Primary contact with program participants. Provide information regarding program policies and activities.
- Initiate and sign charge credits for department debit card accounts.
- Responsible for updating meal plan information in student information billing system.
- Coordinate issuing of cards to the University centers.
- Responsible for requisition and purchase orders for Connection Card Office supplies.
- Monitor and maintain Residence Hall Checkbook system and sign all checks.
- Develop flyers, brochures, handouts and PowerPoint presentations used to advertise program.

- Credit housing and dining late charges
- Travel as needed for Connection Card business.
- Responsible for collecting money from the CSVT machines located in Holmes Dining Hall.
- Serve on various University and departmental committees.

During the Director's review conference, Mr. Caveness indicated that the Connection Card program took more time than indicated and accounted for closer to half of his time.

Cat's C-Store (30%)

- Direct set-up and service.
- Maintain accurate cash reports
- Lead customer service associated with campus convenience stores and espresso bars.
- Direct, lead and supervise multiple units and promotions simultaneously.
- Work closely in conjunction with the management supervisory team to facilitate excellent product mix and customer service.
- Monitor student meal card system and ensure that meal card reader/POS terminal properly function at all times.
- Run all reports associated with meal card readers after each meal period and at closing.
- Ensure candies, snacks, groceries, health care/beauty, frozen, cooler choices are properly set up and stocked at all times and ensure a high standard rotation.
- Direct proper clean-up of all service areas, dining rooms and storage areas, including recycling and trash.

Espresso Location (15%)

- Manage Espresso bars (four locations).
- Develop and maintain customer service standards.
- Order and maintain inventory of supplies necessary for operations.
- Develop standards for storage and rotation of supplies.
- Work with coffee vendor to ensure all locations offer a quality mix of current grab-n-go and new trends in the espresso industry.
- Ensure that all student baristas are trained and made aware of proper techniques.

The remaining duties involve staff supervision, which also applies to the above sections, as well as working with Kronos, the time and attendance program.

Class Specifications

When comparing the assignment of work and level of responsibility to the available class specifications, the class series concept (if one exists) followed by definition and distinguishing characteristics are primary considerations. While examples of typical work identified in a class

specification do not form the basis for an allocation, they lend support to the work envisioned within a classification.

There is not a class series concept for the **Food Service Manager** class series. However, starting with the Food Service Manager 1 definition, the assigned responsibilities have to do with managing and coordinating large-scale food preparation and services "where 4,000 to 12,000 meals are prepared each month" (Exhibit C-1). While your work includes aspects of food service oversight as it relates to the convenience store and espresso stands, the overall focus does not involve large-scale dining services. Therefore, allocation to the Food Service Manager classes is not the best fit.

The **Program Manager** class definitions state that incumbents "[s]upervise a division of a major administrative department, operating unit or program undertaking relieving the senior official of operating and administrative detail. Plan, coordinate and implement all functions required by the activity."

Program Manager distinguishing characteristics include the following:

. . . administer, supervise, direct and advise on activities involved in providing an essential management service within the institution. . . . responsible for advising and assisting, with minimal direction, the senior official and other administrators in the organization on matters pertaining to the program. . . . achieve the goals and objectives of the program by providing, obtaining, and/or coordinating activities as they affect the institution.

. . . involve a wide scope of complex duties and responsibilities in the management of a program which may involve a combination of two or more of the following services: Project management, funds management, contract administration, management analysis, property management, space management, program management, budget planning, public information, faculty, administrative, classified staff and student services administration, personnel administration, and staff supervision. . . . delegated decision-making authority.

Program manager at the "A" level are typically first-line supervisors, and are characterized by their total responsibility for a program or management services to an administrative supervisor.

Program Managers at the "B" level are typically second- or third-line supervisors and are distinguished by their responsibility for total control of a program for a particular academic or administrative unit.

In addition, the State Human Resources Glossary of Classification Terms further defines Program Manager as follows:

Program Manager. Duties involve authority over:

- Developing program goals and objectives.
- Developing timetables and work plans to achieve program goals and objectives.

- Developing program policies and procedures.
- Preparing program budgets, adjusting allotments and authorizing expenditures.
- Controlling allocation of program resources.
- Setting and adjusting program priorities.
- Evaluating program effectiveness.

Your position has responsibility for overseeing the daily functions of the Connection Card program and one assigned convenience store and four espresso stands. However, your position does not fully exercise the scope or breadth of authority anticipated at the Program Manager level. Instead, your position coordinates and supervises the day-to-day operations of these programs and facilities.

The scope and complexity of these areas do not reach the requirements of the definition for this class for supervising a division of a major administrative department, operating unit or program. Development of program goals and policies, as well as budget and allocation of program resources or major program changes are discussed with the Director of Dining Services, who retains overall authority in these areas. Therefore, allocation to the Program Manager classes is not the best fit.

At the **Program Support Supervisor 2 (PSS 2)** level, the definition reads as follows:

Supervise program support staff involved in the performance of duties associated with a highly specialized or technical program(s) and assist in the development of program policies and budgets. Act as liaison between the program and outside organizations.

The PSS 2 distinguishing characteristics include the following responsibilities:

Assist in planning, implementing, and evaluating policies; devise and implement new procedures; develop information to support budgetary requests and project income and expenditures.

The primary distinction is the requirement to assist in the development of program policies and budgets.

Further, although examples of typical work identified in a class specification do not form the basis for an allocation, they lend support to the work envisioned within a classification. Some of the PSS 2 typical work examples include the following:

Within the specialized program:

- Establish work priorities, ensure deadlines are met;
- Assist in planning, implementing, and evaluating institutional policies related to program specialty; devise and implement new procedures to facilitate administration . . .;
- Coordinate program functions with appropriate agencies and departments to accomplish program activities; promote the program on campus and with outside organizations; represent the program at meetings;

- Advise students, staff, program participants and/or the public regarding program content, policies and activities; recommend alternative courses of action;
- Develop information to support budgetary requests; project income and expenditures required to maintain program activities; administer program budgets; sign vouchers; receive, process and deposit funds associated with program activities; maintain records regarding funds.

Your position has taken on more responsibilities with the Connection Card Program, and some aspects of your job align with the Program Support Supervisor 2 class level. For example, your position assists the Dining Services Director in managing all aspects of the program, which include coordinating program functions; promoting the program on campus and assisting staff and students with card services, and acting as a representative for the program.

During the Director's review conference, you also clarified that you assist the Director in planning, implementing, and evaluating policies related to your program areas and that you devise and implement new procedures, which also reach the PSS 2 level. However, the level of assistance you provide to policy development and budget is more in line with the PSS 1 level. For example, the procedures you develop and implement relate more to process than policy development and the overall scope of your work is operational in nature. Further, you indicated that you monitor the budget to ensure operations remain within established budgetary guidelines. These duties are more closely aligned with the PSS 1 job class.

I recognize there is overlap between the PSS 1 and PSS 2 classes. If the duties and responsibilities related to the Connection Card Program continue to evolve into developing information in support of budgetary requests and they comprise a majority of your work, allocation to the PSS 2 level may be appropriate. However, at the time relevant to this review, the scope of your duties and overall level of assigned responsibilities better align with the PSS 1 class.

The **Program Support Supervisor 1 (PSS 1)** definition states the following:

Supervise support staff involved in the performance of duties associated with a highly specialized or technical program(s). Coordinate the operation of a specialized or technical program(s). Act as liaison between the program and outside organizations.

The PSS 1 distinguishing characteristics include the following:

With delegated authority, interview and recommend selection of applicants, train new employees, assign and schedule work, act upon leave requests, conduct annual performance evaluations and recommend disciplinary action.

Under general direction, perform work using knowledge and experience specific to the program. Devise and implement new procedures and exercise independent judgment in interpreting and applying rules and regulations. Independently advise students, staff,

program participants and/or the public regarding program content, policies, procedures and activities; select/recommend alternative courses of action; and either:

- Project, monitor, maintain, initiate and/or approve expenditures on program budgets

OR

- Have extensive involvement with students, staff, the public and/or agencies in carrying out program activities, and coordinate, schedule and monitor program activities to determine consistency with program goals.

The PSS 1 class specification encompasses the duties and responsibilities assigned to your position. You are responsible for supervising two permanent staff members as well as several student employees. You devise and implement new procedures, apply independent judgment and independently advise students, staff, faculty, visitors, and outside vendors about Dining Services and the specific facilities you supervise, as well as the Connection Card Program. Your position establishes and maintains procedures, provides input to policies, processes control of cash receipts and use of card system, and monitors expenditures.

In addition, PSS 1 typical work examples that closely match the duties assigned to your position include the following:

- Oversee the day-to-day operation of the program(s);
- Establish work priorities, ensure deadlines are met;
- Coordinate program functions with appropriate agencies and departments to accomplish program activities; promote the program on campus and with outside organizations; represent the program at meetings;
- Advise students, staff, program participants and/or the public regarding program content, policies and activities; recommend alternative courses of action;
- Monitor budget status in line with program activities, plans or priorities; maintain program budgets and initiate corrective action; sign vouchers; receive, process and deposit funds; assist in the preparation of grants and proposals;

At the time of your position's reallocation, the overall duties and responsibilities best fit within the PSS 1 classification.

It is clear your position is an asset to Dining Service. A position's allocation is not based on an evaluation of performance or an individual's ability to perform higher-level work. Rather, it is based on the majority of work assigned to a position and how that work best aligns with the available job classes.

Further, the Personnel Resources Board has previously determined that most positions within the civil service system occasionally perform duties that appear in more than one

classification. However, when determining the appropriate classification for a specific position, the duties and responsibilities of that position must be considered in their entirety and the position must be allocated to the classification that provides the best fit overall for the majority of the position's duties and responsibilities. Dudley v. Dept. of Labor and Industries, PRB Case No. R-ALLO-07-007 (2007).

In this case, while some aspects of your duties and responsibilities fit within the PSS 2 job class, the overall scope of duties and level of responsibility at the time relevant to this review best fit the Program Support Supervisor 1 classification.

Appeal Rights

RCW 41.06.170 governs the right to appeal. RCW 41.06.170(4) provides, in relevant part, the following:

An employee incumbent in a position at the time of its allocation or reallocation, or the agency utilizing the position, may appeal the allocation or reallocation to the Washington personnel resources board. Notice of such appeal must be filed in writing within thirty days of the action from which appeal is taken.

The mailing address for the Personnel Resources Board (PRB) is P.O. Box 40911, Olympia, Washington, 98504-0911. The PRB Office is located on the 4th floor of the Insurance Building, 302 Sid Snyder Avenue SW, Olympia, Washington. The main telephone number is (360) 902-9820, and the fax number is (360) 586-4694.

If no further action is taken, the Director's determination becomes final.

c: Stephen Sarchet, CWU
Lisa Skriletz, SHR

Enclosure: List of Exhibits

ANDREW CAVENESS v CWU
ALLO-12-050

A. Andrew Caveness Exhibits

1. Letter requesting Director's Review received September 6, 2012 (1 page)
2. Director's Review Form received September 6, 2012 (3 pages)
3. August 16, 2012 CWU reallocation letter (1 page)

B. CWU Exhibits

1. Food Service Supervisor 2 Position Description (6 pages)
2. CWU Position Description Worksheet (3 pages)
3. Program Support Supervisor 1 Classification Specification
4. Program Support Supervisor 2 Classification Specification
5. Organizational Chart

C. Director's Exhibits

1. Food Service Manager 1 Classification Specification
2. Program Manager A & B Classification Specifications