



STATE OF WASHINGTON
OFFICE OF FINANCIAL MANAGEMENT

STATE HUMAN RESOURCES DIVISION | DIRECTOR'S REVIEW PROGRAM
P.O. Box 40911 · Olympia, WA 98504-0911 · (360) 902-9820 · FAX (360) 586-4694

June 26, 2013

TO: Teresa Parsons, SPHR
Director's Review Program Supervisor

FROM: Kris Brophy, SPHR
Director's Review Program Investigator

SUBJECT: Carol Howe v North Seattle Community College (NSCC)
Allocation Review Request ALLO-12-053

Director's Determination

This position review was based on the work performed for the six-month period prior to June 6, 2012, the date NSCC Human Resources received Ms. Howe's request for a position review. As the Director's Review Investigator, I carefully considered all of the documentation in the file, the exhibits, and the written comments provided by both parties. Based on my review and analysis of Ms. Howe's assigned duties and responsibilities, I conclude her position should be reallocated to the Instruction and Classroom Support Technician 3 (ICST3) classification.

Background

On June 6, 2012, NSCC HR received Ms. Howe's Position Review Request (PRR), requesting that her Program Coordinator position be reallocated to the Instruction and Classroom Support Technician 3 (ICST3) class (Exhibit B-2).

NSCC HR conducted an allocation review of Ms. Howe's position and notified her on August 24, 2012 that her position was being reallocated to the Instruction and Classroom Support Technician 2 (ICST2) class (Exhibit B-1).

On September 24, 2012, the State Human Resources Division, OFM received Ms. Howe's request for a Director's review of NSCC's allocation determination (Exhibit A-1).

On May 1, 2013, I conducted a Director's review telephone conference. Present for the conference were Mr. Carol Howe; Ms. Robin Ledbetter, Council Representative, WFSE; Dr. Tom Braziunas, Associate Dean for e-Learning, NSCC; and Mr. David Bittenbender HR Director, NSCC.

Rationale for Director's Determination

The purpose of a position review is to determine which classification best describes the overall duties and responsibilities of a position. A position review is neither a measurement of the volume of work performed, nor an evaluation of the expertise with which that work is performed. A position review is a comparison of the duties and responsibilities of a particular position to the available classification specifications. This review results in a determination of the class that best describes the overall duties and responsibilities of the position. Liddle-Stamper v. Washington State University, PAB Case No. 3722-A2 (1994).

Duties and Responsibilities

As stated in the position purpose statement of the PRR, Ms. Howe provides technical instructional support services for the NSCC e-Learning Support Center.

Ms. Howe describes her major job duties as follows:

40% Assist with Course/ Program Development.

Mentor, advise and train faculty through the process of their course/program development to insure that the process is completed using the CAS approved Standards and Guidelines, includes principles of Universal Design for Learning and meets the Quality Matters standards and rubric.

Tasks:

- Meet with faculty, deans, department coordinators, and grant representatives to advise and assist in the processes of making programs, courses, and instruction materials available for delivery via the online learning environment.
- Set up development schedules that include objectives and itemized tasks with a corresponding timeline for completion.
- Troubleshoot spontaneous requests for assistance with technology.

Quarterly Workshops

Tasks:

- Develop a quarterly workshop schedule.
- Work with the associate dean to determine the topics to be covered.
- Develop training materials as needed for the workshops.
- Assist with delivering workshops
- Deliver workshops
- Organize DOES-IT Buzz sessions to include the topics covered, recruiting of participants and promotion of the events.

30% ANGEL Online Training Sequence

Instruction and Course/Program development.

Tasks include:

- Design and create materials using principles of Universal Design for learning for an online sequence of 5 three hour learning management system (LMS) training sessions and the delivery of the instruction materials.
- Develop the training materials.
- Announce the register sequence participants.
- Deliver a New Faculty Orientation to the online procedures at NSCC that includes an orientation to the ANGEL online training process.
- Facilitate the interaction of faculty with the course materials and their successful completion of the sequence.
- Restructure or modify training to better accommodate the needs of the participants as needed.
- Track, record, report and archive participation data.
- Communicate with participants, their deans and department coordinators.
- Maintain the course to include content updates.
- Follow up with additional training as it pertains to faculty seeking refresher information.

15% Curriculum and Academic Standards e-L subcommittee (CAS eL)

Approval process for courses preparing for delivery using the online modality.

Tasks Include:

- Organize the CAS eLearning subcommittee for the purpose of reviewing courses and making recommendations; recruit four faculty volunteers to serve on the committee. Develop the procedures followed by the committee. Lead the review process.
- Set up the CAS eL schedule for review based on criteria from the CAS meeting schedule and the printing schedule of the Quarterly schedule.
- Guide faculty through this process by orienting them to the process, assisting with the completion of the paperwork, assistance with building the four weeks of required course content, tracking to insure that the objectives are completed within the timelines established by CAS.

15% Develop Training Materials for Faculty

Tasks:

- Design and create the NeLSC Faculty Support website
- Imagine, design and build the collaborative Faculty Zone website for information about current technologies, peer activity, conferences, and templates.
- Design and create the Faculty Prep site used with the in-person ANGEL training classes.
- Design and create ANGEL Faculty Support site. Populate the site with training and "how-to" materials created by myself and others. E.g. pdfs, docs, videos, etc.
- Design and Create the ANGEL Student Support materials.
- Design and Create Workshop materials.
- Design and maintain the organization system for these training materials.
- Update the training materials as able.

Supervisor's Comments

Dr. Tom Braziunas, Associate Dean, e-Learning, is Ms. Howe's immediate supervisor. Dr. Braziunas completed the supervisor's portion of the PRR. He indicates that Ms. Howe's duties are accurate and complete and he supports her request to be reallocated to the ICST 3 class.

In the supervisor's comment section of the PRR, he states:

The organization and operation of the e-Learning Support Center has continued to evolve along with the educational technology landscape of which "online learning" is now only one component. There has been a natural expansion of Carol's responsibilities that has accompanied the growth in the College's instructional need for learning and implementing the following:

- New technologies (e.g. complex online learning management systems, multimedia and social media communication tools, interactive online lesson and assessment building programs)
- New hardware (e.g. smart pens, smart boards, mobile devices like iPads and smart phones)
- New e-Learning pedagogies (e.g. universal design principles, Quality Matters standards, "flipping" classroom equipment, high-quality blended learning approaches).

...

...her work responsibilities with faculty, deans and colleagues have expanded. Duties not reflected in her "program coordinator" status include her leadership in the CAS approval process of new online curriculum to meet the College's e-Learning design principles and best practices; her development, maintenance

and facilitation of an online version of our faculty training course; her leadership in development of the College's websites of online resources for faculty developing, delivering and maintaining courses that include the use of educational technologies (whether the courses are online, hybrid or web-enhanced campus-based); and her independent research and recommendation of new technologies, hardware and pedagogies for teaching effectively using educational technologies.

Dr. Braziunas indicates that Ms. Howe has been delegated the following decision-making authority with regard to her position:

- Determining whether an instructor has successfully completed online learning management system training.
- Decisions on quarterly composition and schedule of joint Teaching & Learning Center (TLC) / North's e-Learning Support Center (NeLSC) workshops.
- Decisions on content and presentation of NeLSC online resource websites for faculty.
- Decisions on whether CAS approval process for online curriculum has been successfully completed.
- Decisions on which workshops/sessions to attend to bring back information from conferences.

Summary of Ms. Howe's Perspective

Ms. Howe contends her position reaches the ICST 3 class on the basis of the following:

- Responsibility for providing technical expertise to faculty and others in the department regarding the design and development of e-Learning and other online instructional materials.
- Obtaining specialized education and training and sharing this information with others in the department and with faculty via workshops.
- Developing and delivering training materials to faculty independently of the Associate Dean such as the department's 15 hour mandatory faculty orientation training course.
- Working with Deans and Faculty Coordinators, Faculty and staff to create e-Learning components of programs (including multiple courses with a cohesive presentation and functionality) for online delivery.
- Acting as a representative of the CAS e-Learning subcommittee. This includes reviewing the content and presentation of courses that are going through the CAS eL process for online delivery approval.
- No longer performing clerical program coordinator functions.

Ms. Howe asserts her overall level of responsibility and decision-making authority, and her level of responsibility reaches the ICST 3 class. Ms. Howe asserts her position should be reallocated to that class.

Summary of NSCC's Reasoning

NSCC asserts the overall level and scope of duties and responsibilities assigned to Ms. Howe's position does not reach the ICST 3 class.

NSCC acknowledges Ms. Howe's position does not fit within the traditional context of the ICST class series. NSCC acknowledges that her role has evolved over the past several years and has shifted from providing primarily programmatic administrative coordination and scheduling support to providing e-learning technical instructional support to faculty and other staff.

However, NSCC asserts Ms. Howe's responsibility for supporting faculty and academic and vocational discipline instructors in becoming qualified distance learning instructors; maintaining currency with the changing distance learning technologies; keeping instructors up to date on online learning applications, and working with the CAS e-Learning subcommittee are consistent with the ICST 2 level class.

NSCC asserts Ms. Howe's position does not perform complex design work as the primary emphasis of her position. NSCC asserts that faculty members retain responsibility and expertise for the content of their instructional programs and that Ms. Howe assists in the development of the online delivery of these instructional programs following standard guidelines and practices which is consistent with ICST 2 class level of responsibility.

For these reasons, NSCC asserts Ms. Howe's position is properly allocated to the ICST 2 class.

Comparison of Duties

When comparing the assignment of work and level of responsibility to the available class specifications, the Class Series Concept (if one exists) followed by the Definition and Distinguishing Characteristics are primary considerations. While examples of typical work identified in a class specification do not form the basis for an allocation, they lend support to the work envisioned within a classification.

The Class Series Concept for the Instruction and Classroom Support Technician series states:

Positions in this series perform various instructional and classroom support services including academic and vocational instructional programs, scientific instructional programs, and extension educational activities. Duties typically include assisting in the individualized or group instruction of students in development of learning skills; or working with faculty or instructors in preparing, modifying, and/or developing instructional programs, teaching aids, materials and equipment associated with shop, classroom, or laboratory instruction which requires positions to have technical knowledge of the discipline(s).

Ms. Howe provides instructional technical support to faculty members in many academic and vocational disciplines across campus to assist them in becoming qualified distance learning instructors. She also provides e-Learning technical support to faculty, deans, department coordinators and grant representatives to advise and assist staff in the process of preparing courses and instructional materials ready for online delivery. For these reasons her position should be allocated to a class within the Instruction and Classroom Support Technician series.

Comparison of Duties to Instruction and Classroom Support Technician classes

Instruction and Classroom Support Technician 2

The Definition for the ICST 2 class state:

Performs professional/technical instructional support involving the use of scientific, technical, and/or academic knowledge, materials, and techniques. Positions plan and conduct experiments and demonstrations in a formal course work setting in a non-scientific discipline such as arts, humanities, social sciences, vocational programs, etc.; or provide instructional support to science-related undergraduate courses requiring knowledge of a scientific discipline, electronics, and/or engineering; or serve as a field program assistant including planning and conducting programs, meetings, seminars, and other activities associated with a cooperative extension or research program (such as in the areas of meal planning, food buying, family budgeting, sanitation procedures, food preservation, clothing construction, family communications, consumer education, or 4-H youth and community development). Responsibilities typically include assisting faculty in the development of programs of instruction. Duties require limited design/development work such as modifying and/or adapting existing experiments and demonstrations, or implementing new experiments or demonstrations using standard techniques and procedures.

The primary focus of Ms. Howe's position, and the majority of her duties as a whole, extend beyond the requirements stated in the Definition and Distinguishing Characteristics of the ICST 2 class.

Ms. Howe's duties extend beyond performing limited design and development work. In addition, the scope of her duties with respect to providing technical expertise to faculty and others in the design and development of e-Learning and other online instructional materials reaches beyond the level anticipated by this class. Thus, the duties she performs including obtaining specialized education and training and sharing this information with others in the department and with faculty via workshops; developing and delivering training materials to faculty independently of the Associate Dean; working with Deans and Faculty Coordinators, Faculty and staff to create e-Learning components of programs are all performed at a higher level than anticipated by this class.

For these reasons her position should not be allocated to the ICST 2 class.

Instruction and Classroom Support Technician 3

The Definition for the Instruction and Classroom Support Technician 3 class states:

Coordinates instructional support activities in a basic or applied science teaching program. Coordinates support services for a variety of courses; provides professional/technical support requiring knowledge of a scientific discipline, electronics and/or engineering.

The Distinguishing Characteristics for the ICST 3 class state:

Senior-level class responsible for coordinating instructional support activities, designing/developing instructional support programs or designing and constructing equipment. Under general direction, provides support to courses requiring an emphasis in complex design and development tasks such as developing experiments/demonstrations where only general theoretical concepts are identified, designing instructional support applications based on current research findings.

The primary allocating factors at the ICST 3 level include serving as a senior-level technician responsible for coordinating instructional support activities in a basic or applied science teaching program which includes providing support to a variety of courses. Incumbents design and develop instructional support programs, or design and construct equipment with primary emphasis on performing complex design and development tasks.

The State HR Glossary of Classification Terms defines senior as follows:

Senior - The performance of work requiring the consistent application of advanced knowledge and requiring a skilled and experienced practitioner to function independently. Senior-level work includes devising methods and processes to resolve complex or difficult issues that have broad potential impact. These issues typically involve competing interests, multiple clients, conflicting rules or practices, a range of possible solutions, or other elements that contribute to complexity. The senior-level has full authority to plan, prioritize, and handle all duties within an assigned area of responsibility. Senior-level employees require little supervision and their work is not typically checked by others.

Ms. Howe's position does not fit within the traditional context of the ICST class series of assisting in the individualized or group instruction of students in the development of learning skills in a classroom or laboratory setting. Still, her role has shifted from providing primarily programmatic administrative coordination and scheduling support to providing technical e-learning instructional support to faculty and other staff. Ms. Howe therefore performs the equivalent of coordinating instructional support activities in a basic or applied science teaching program which includes providing technical support to a variety of courses, and as stated in the PRR, coordinating and providing technical support to the e-Learning Support Center's functions and activities.

For example, Ms. Howe coordinates a variety of e-learning Support Center functions which includes providing direct e-Learning development technical support to faculty in preparation for implementation to online delivery. This also includes providing technical support to various activities and functions within the department including supporting and facilitating the CAS eL committee function and approval process, participating in the Information Technology Advisory Committee, integrating Educational Technology into the campus classrooms, assisting with the Anesthesia Technology Program transition, establishing Quality Workshop schedules, assisting in the development and implementation of the ANGEL Online Training Sequence for faculty, and assisting with the District Grant Awards process. She also provides administrative support to faculty with respect to the Collaboration Day and other Support Center activities. She also provides on demand classroom technical assistance and support, and she supports the faculty orientation process.

Secondly, while she does not directly support instructional programs in a traditional classroom setting, or design or construct demonstration or other equipment in traditional classroom or

laboratory setting, Ms. Howe does fully support faculty and academic and vocational discipline instructors through the development process of becoming qualified distance learning instructors.

Further, Ms. Howe provides technical expertise to faculty and others in the department regarding the design and development of e-Learning and other online instructional materials. Ms. Howe independently consults with faculty and departmental chairs across campus regarding their instructional needs. Her duties also include researching new online learning pedagogies and other equipment or technology needs, and suggesting solutions and methods for the most effective use of converting to the online environment.

Additionally, her responsibility working with the CAS e-Learning committee is consistent with the ICST 3 level class which includes advising faculty through the online course/program development process to ensure the process is fully completed following prescribed CAS Standards and Guidelines. As part of this process, she meets with faculty, deans, department coordinators and grant representatives across campus over an extended period of time to advise them and assist them in developing their online programs, courses, and instruction materials. This includes independently working with the faculty and other instructors to develop the online course format following designated design principles and standards. She also performs related administrative tasks for this process including setting up development schedules that include objectives and itemized tasks with corresponding timelines for completion.

Ms. Howe performs complex design and development work consistent with the ICST 3 level class. This is further supported by the examples of work Ms. Howe provided regarding the other functions and tasks she performs. In summary, Ms. Howe fully assists faculty in developing and implementing the online component of instructional programs. She maintains currency with the changing distance learning technologies and keeps instructors up to date with respect to online learning applications. In total, the overall scope and level of responsibility of these duties is consistent with the ICST 3 class.

Thus, the primary focus of Ms. Howe's position, and the majority of her duties as a whole are accurately described by the Definition and Distinguishing Characteristics of the ICST 3 class. Ms. Howe coordinates the instructional support activities for the e-Learning Support Center and serves as a senior-level technician performing complex e-Learning instructional design and development tasks for faculty and staff.

In Salsberry v. Washington State Parks and Recreation Commission, PRB Case No. R-ALLO-06-013 (2007), the Personnel Resources Board addressed the concept of best fit. The Board referenced Allegri v. Washington State University, PAB Case No. ALLO-96-0026 (1998), in which the Personnel Appeals Board noted that while the appellant's duties and responsibilities did not encompass the full breadth of the duties and responsibilities described by the classification to which his position was allocated, on a best fit basis, the classification best described the level, scope and diversity of the overall duties and responsibilities of his position.

In summary, Ms. Howe's scope of responsibility, complexity of duties, level of analysis and level of decision-making authority reach the ICST 3 class definition. Therefore, the primary focus of Ms. Howe's position, and the majority of her duties as a whole are more accurately described by the ICST 3 level class which describes the emphasis of her position in coordinating instructional support activities for the Technology division and serving a senior-level technician and resolving operational problems and performing complex e-Learning instructional design and development tasks for faculty and staff. Ms. Howe's position should be reallocated to the ICST 3 level class.

Appeal Rights

RCW 41.06.170 governs the right to appeal. RCW 41.06.170(4) provides, in relevant part, the following:

The mailing address for the Personnel Resources Board (PRB) is P.O. Box 40911, Olympia, WA 98504-0911. An employee incumbent in a position at the time of its allocation or reallocation, or the agency utilizing the position, may appeal the allocation or reallocation to the Washington personnel resources board. Notice of such appeal must be filed in writing within thirty days of the action from which appeal is taken.

The PRB Office is located on the 4th floor of the Insurance Building, 302 Sid Snyder Avenue SW, Olympia, Washington, 98501-1342. The main telephone number is (360) 902-9820, and the fax number is (360) 586-4694.

If no further action is taken, the Director's determination becomes final.

c: Carol Howe, NSCC
Robin Ledbetter, WFSE
David Bittenbender, NSCC
Lisa Skriletz, SHR

Enclosure: List of Exhibits

CAROL HOWE v NORTH SEATTLE COMMUNITY COLLEGE

ALLO-12-053

List of exhibits

A. Carol Howe Exhibits

1. Director's Review Form for Carol Howe, received September 24, 2012 (2 pages)
2. Copy of NSCC allocation determination letter dated August 24, 2012 (2 pages)
3. Exhibit packet submitted March 21, 2013 with duties schematic and table of contents with additional exhibits:
 - I. Instruction & Classroom Support Technician 3 Class Specification (page 3)
 - II. Current Job Description (page 5)
 - III. Determination of Position Review (7)
 - IV. Program Support / Coordinate Instructional Support (page 10)
 - a. Faculty Development Resource Center
 - b. Educational Technologies Advisory Center
 - c. Informational Technology Advisory Committee
 - d. Integrating Educational Technologies to the campus classrooms
 - e. Anesthesia Technology Program Transition
 - f. Quarterly Workshop Schedule
 - g. ANGEL Online Training Sequence
 - h. Curriculum & Academic Standards e-Learning Subcommittee
 - i. District Grants
 - V. Faculty Support (page 22)
 - a. Collaboration Day 2012
 - b. On demand classroom support
 - c. New Faculty Orientation
 - d. Deliver Faculty Development Workshops
 - i. Lead
 - ii. Support
 - VI. Student Support (page 25)
 - a. Workforce Development (grant) Nursing Cohort
 - b. Campus Classroom Orientations
 - c. 1:1 technical support on demand
 - i. Orientation
 - ii. Follow up
 - VII. Site Specific (page 29)
 - a. North's e-Learning Support Center (NeLSC) office expansion project 2012

B. North Seattle Community College cover letter submitting exhibits

1. SSCC Allocation determination memo from David Bittenbender to Carol Howe dated August 24, 2012
2. Position Review Request form – Employee section for Carol Howe, received by NSCC HR on June 6, 2012.
3. Position Review Request form Part III - Management and HR representative statement. dated June 6, 2012
4. State of Washington classification specifications
5. Organizational chart for E-Learning Continuing Education, NSCC
6. Position Description form for Carol Howe, dated March 22, 2005

C. Class Specifications

1. State HR Class Specification for Program Coordinator, 107N
2. State HR Class Specification for Instruction & Classroom Support Technician 1, 255M
3. State HR Class Specification for Instruction & Classroom Support Technician 2, 255N
4. State HR Class Specification for Instruction & Classroom Support Technician 3, 255O
5. State HR Class Specification for Program Specialist 2 107I

D. Additional exhibits

1. Email exchange between the parties regarding appeals process and the submission of an additional exhibit