



**STATE OF WASHINGTON**  
**OFFICE OF FINANCIAL MANAGEMENT**  
STATE HUMAN RESOURCES DIVISION | DIRECTOR'S REVIEW PROGRAM  
*P.O. Box 40911 · Olympia, WA 98504-0911 · (360) 902-9820 · FAX (360) 586-4694*

January 31, 2014

TO: Teresa Parsons, SPHR  
Director's Review Program Supervisor

FROM: Kris Brophy, SPHR  
Director's Review Program Investigator

SUBJECT: Shawn Bottcher v. Department of Social and Health Services  
Allocation Review Request ALLO-13-031

**Director's Determination**

A management-initiated position review was conducted on Mr. Bottcher's position based upon an updated Position Description form (PDF) for position EP82, received by the Classification and Compensation Unit, Human Resources Division, DSHS, (HRD) on March 5, 2013 and effective April 17, 2013 (Exhibit B-2). As the Director's Review Investigator, I carefully considered all of the documentation in the file, including the exhibits presented during the Director's review conference, and the verbal comments provided by both parties. Based on my review and analysis of Mr. Bottcher's assigned duties and responsibilities, I conclude his position is properly allocated to the Plumber/Pipefitter/Steamfitter (PPS) classification.

**Background**

Mr. Bottcher is a member of the Life/Safety Team #1 within Central Roving Team as part of the Facilities maintenance operations at Western State Hospital (WSH). This position review was based on a management-initiated request to review the work performed by Mr. Bottcher and other co-workers as part of a reorganization process conducted by DSHS management personnel.

By memorandum dated March 28, 2013, HRD notified Mr. Bottcher that his position was being reallocated from the PPS Lead class to the PPS class, effective April 17, 2013 (Exhibit B-1).

On April 9, 2013, the Director's Review Program, State HR, received Mr. Bottcher's request for a Director's review of DSHS's allocation determination (Exhibit A-1). In his letter, Mr. Bottcher asked that his position remain allocated to the PPS Lead classification.

On January 14, 2013, I conducted a Director's review conference. Present during the conference were Shawn Bottcher, DSHS, Sean Dannen, WFSE Counsel Representative;

Thomas Blume, CMO Administrator, DSHS; Richard Texidor, HRC, HRD; and John Black, HRC, HRD.

Mr. Texidor explained the basis for revising Mr. Bottcher's PDF was due to a management-initiated effort to consolidate and reorganize maintenance operations at WSH. Prior to the reallocation leading to this Director's review, WSH management submitted an updated PDF to HRD office, requesting that Mr. Bottcher's position be reallocated to the PPS class due to the removal of lead duties from his position. As a result of that request, HRD reviewed Mr. Bottcher's position based on the revised position description and determined his position should be reallocated to the PPS class effective April 17, 2013.

During the review conference, Mr. Dannen stated DSHS did not talk with Mr. Bottcher as part of its position review process. Mr. Texidor acknowledged that management and Human Resources staff did not speak with Mr. Bottcher during this management-initiated position review process.

In this case WSH management personnel revised Mr. Bottcher's position description but did not seek his input. While input from the position's incumbent is recommended, it is not required. Both the Personnel Appeals Board and the Personnel Resources Board have held that because a current and accurate description of a position's duties and responsibilities is documented in an approved classification questionnaire, the classification questionnaire becomes the basis for allocation of a position. An allocation determination must be based on the overall duties and responsibilities as documented in the classification questionnaire. Lawrence v. Dept of Social and Health Services, PAB No. ALLO-99-0027 (2000). The position description that is now in use serves the same purpose as the former classification questionnaire and thus serves as the basis for making a position's allocation determination.

### **Summary of Mr. Bottcher's Perspective**

Mr. Bottcher asserts that his position meets the requirements of the PPS Lead class by his responsibility for directing the Backflow program at WSH as a licensed backflow tester and by continuing to lead the work of the Utility Worker and Maintenance Mechanic workers who are assigned to help him with the Backflow maintenance program.

### **Summary of DSHS's reasoning**

DSHS asserts that based on a management-initiated reorganization process conducted by DSHS management personnel effective April 17, 2013, Mr. Bottcher no longer serves in a Lead capacity as a member of the Life/Safety Team #1. DSHS asserts that effective that date; Mr. Bottcher no longer leads the work of the other maintenance staff previously identified as Life Safety Team #2. DSHS asserts that Mr. Bottcher's position is properly allocated to the PPS class.

### **Rationale for Director's Determination**

The purpose of a position review is to determine which classification best describes the overall duties and responsibilities of a position. A position review is neither a measurement of the volume of work performed, nor an evaluation of the expertise with which that work is performed. The scope of this Director's review is limited to a comparison of the duties and responsibilities of a particular position to the available classification specifications. The purpose of this review is to make a determination of the class that best describes the overall duties and responsibilities of

the position. See Liddle-Stamper v. Washington State University, PAB Case No. 3722-A2 (1994).

### Duties and Responsibilities

Mr. Bottcher is a skilled plumber working at the WSH, Child Study and Treatment Center, and JRA Oakridge Group Home campus. Mr. Bottcher is responsible for performing all testing and maintenance activities for all backflow devices (Exhibit A14a and b and Exhibit A-15a and b) across those facilities. This includes performing all maintenance and testing activities including planning and establishing testing schedules, monitoring, installing, and repairing all backflow devices within his assigned area of responsibility.

His assigned duties and responsibilities are summarized from the updated Position Description Form as follows:

- 65% Performs skilled journey-level plumbing work, install, maintain, inspect, and repair pipes, storm sewers, septic tanks, sewage mains and lavatories, valves, drains, basins, tubs, lavatories, sinks, gates, hydrants, water coolers, and dishwashers. Install, maintain, and repair backflows.
- 30% Utilize a computerized maintenance management (MP2) for corrective work orders and preventive maintenance. Compile reports of completed work orders as required.

### Class Specifications

When comparing the assignment of work and level of responsibility to the available class specifications, the class series concept (if one exists) followed by definition and distinguishing characteristics are primary considerations.

### Comparison of Duties to Plumber/Pipefitter/Steamfitter Lead

The Definition for this class states:

Leads and performs journey-level plumbing, steamfitting, and/or pipe fitting work.

The Distinguishing Characteristics for this class states:

Positions in this class are distinguished by the responsibility to assign and lead work at a project or job location, to instruct other assigned plumbers, to correct and specify methods, and to perform plumbing, steam fitting, and pipe fitting work.

The *Glossary of Classification Terms* defines "**Lead**" as: "*An employee who performs the same or similar duties as other employees in his/her work group and has the designated responsibility to regularly assign, instruct, and check the work of those employees on an ongoing basis.*"

Mr. Bottcher's position does not include designated responsibility for leading other employees in his work unit as required by the definition for this class. During the review conference Mr. Texidor explained that effective April 17, 2013, Mr. Bottcher no longer had designated responsibility to lead other maintenance staff previously identified as Life Safety Team #2 (See

organization chart – Exhibit B-3). Effective that date, Mr. Bottcher reported to Mr. Blain Wickham, Maintenance Mechanic 4, who assumed responsibility for supervising Mr. Bottcher as a member of Life Safety Team #1. In addition, the other positions were reassigned to report directly to Mr. Wickham as members of Life Safety Team #2 (See organization chart - Exhibit B-9).

During the review conference, the parties explained that Mr. Wickham has initial responsibility for overseeing and processing all maintenance work orders that come to his unit through the agency's computerized maintenance management system. Mr. Wickham reviews work orders which are then forwarded within the system to Mr. Bottcher and to the other departmental employees to complete. Mr. Bottcher has access to the system to review the work orders that are assigned to him. Mr. Bottcher stated that he most often determines his own work for the day but will also receive assignments from Mr. Wickham depending on the nature and scope of all work to be performed. Mr. Wickham determines staffing assignments including the Maintenance Mechanic and Utility Worker positions assigned to Life Safety Team #2 who are available to assist Mr. Bottcher in completing his assigned work orders as needed.

Staffing assignments vary according to the skill sets and staffing levels needed to complete each job. Mr. Wickham assigns one or more workers to assist Mr. Bottcher for a work order if needed. Mr. Wickham also retains authority to reassign staff to other assignments for unforeseen issues that arise. Mr. Wickham also authorizes and approves leave and overtime for workers assigned to assist Mr. Bottcher on a particular assignment.

The Glossary of Classification Terms defines "Direct the Work of Others" as follows:

**Direct the Work of Others.** Provides work guidance or direction but is NOT a "lead"; does NOT have the responsibility of assigning, instructing and checking the work of others on a regular and ongoing basis.

Mr. Bottcher's position is more accurately described as directing the work of others. Mr. Bottcher provides work guidance and direction to the maintenance staff assigned to him on a particular work order or other assignment. The scope and nature of Mr. Bottcher's work is fully consistent with directing the work of others as a journey level PPS.

Further, a review of Mr. Bottcher's revised PDF indicates his position does not have designated responsibility for leading staff. Therefore allocating his position to the PPS Lead class is not appropriate.

#### Comparison of Duties to Plumber/Pipefitter/Steamfitter

The Definition for this class states:

Performs skilled plumbing and/or steamfitting work.

Although the Typical Work examples do not form the basis for an allocation, they lend support to the level and scope of work performed by that class. The typical work statements provide for the inspection of work surfaces and the estimation of time and materials for repair as follows:

Installs, maintains and repairs pipes, ...valves...;

Repairs fixtures in shop by refacing, repacking, and re seating valves, cutting and threading pipe, bending pipe, replacing pump bushings and washers, and testing valves and other pressure equipment;

Inspects water mains, fixtures, ... valves, ...to determine need for maintenance and repair;

Cleans, maintains, and repairs power and hand tools; Estimates materials and time needed to complete jobs;

May direct and instruct helpers, patients or inmates; ...

Repairs and replaces pipe and pipe coverings; welds and threads pipe;

Performs shop work such as disassembling valves and equipment, replacing worn parts, and reassembling and testing equipment;

Cleans, maintains and repairs tools and equipment;

Estimates materials and time needed to complete jobs;

[Emphasis added]

Mr. Bottcher's assigned duties are consistent with these statements. Mr. Bottcher is a licensed backflow tester. His duties require him to install, test, maintain and repair all backflow devices within his assigned area of responsibility. His duties also include directing and instructing the work of other employees assigned to assist him as needed to complete his assigned duties. Based on the changes in duties and responsibilities assigned to his position, effective April 17, 2013, the PPS classification best describes Mr. Bottcher's position.

A position's allocation is not a reflection of performance or an individual's ability to perform higher-level work. Rather, it is based on the majority of work assigned to a position and how that work best aligns with the available job classifications. It is clearly evident that Mr. Bottcher is a dedicated staff member and his work is greatly appreciated. Based on the level and scope of the overall duties and responsibilities assigned to his position, the Plumber/Pipefitter/Steamfitter classification is the best fit.

### **Appeal Rights**

RCW 41.06.170 governs the right to appeal. RCW 41.06.170(4) provides, in relevant part, the following:

An employee incumbent in a position at the time of its allocation or reallocation, or the agency utilizing the position, may appeal the allocation or reallocation to the Washington personnel resources board. Notice of such appeal must be filed in writing within thirty days of the action from which appeal is taken.

The mailing address for the Personnel Resources Board (PRB) is P.O. Box 40911, Olympia, Washington, 98504-0911. The PRB Office is located on the 4th floor of the Insurance Building,

302 Sid Snyder Avenue SW, Olympia, Washington. The main telephone number is (360) 902-9820, and the fax number is (360) 586-4694.

If no further action is taken, the Director's determination becomes final.

c:     Shawn Bottcher, DSHS  
       Sean Dannen, WFSE  
       Richard Texidor, HRD, DSHS  
       Lisa Skriletz, SHR

Enclosure: List of Exhibits

**SHAWN BOTTCHER v DSHS**  
**ALLO-13-031**

Shawn Bottcher Exhibits

A. Letter from Shawn Bottcher requesting a Director's Review received April 9, 2013 by State HR with the following exhibits:

1. Shawn Bottcher allocation determination letter dated March 28, 2013
2. PDF for position EP82 received in the Classification and Compensation Unit on March 5, 2013 and signed by the approving authority on April 3, 2013
3. Organizational Chart for SCC Central Roving Team dated February 1, 2013
4. Position Action Request dated March 5, 2013
5. PDF for Shawn Bottcher's position dated November 4, 2010
6. Email memo from Mike Allen to Richard Texidor dated March 5, 2013 requesting downward allocation
7. Plumber/Pipefitter/Steamfitter Class Specification
8. Plumber/Pipefitter/Steamfitter Lead Class Specification
9. Organizational Chart for SCC Central Roving Team dated April 1, 2013
10. Letters of appeal:
  - a. Letter from WFSE counsel representative Sean Dannen dated May 13, 2013
  - b. Letter from Shawn Bottcher requesting Director's Review dated April 5, 2013 (2 pages)
11. Performance Development Plan for Shawn Bottcher dated September 20, 2011
12. Statement from Randy Sanchez, Utility Worker 2, dated April 23, 2013 with attached class specification for Utility Worker 2
13. Statement from Arnold Cox, Maintenance Mechanic 2, with attached class specification for Maintenance Mechanic 2
14. Backflow information - Outdoor
  - a. Outdoor Backflow Program Map
  - b. Outdoor Backflow List
15. Backflow information - Indoor
  - a. Indoor Backflow Program Map
  - b. Backflow Devices List
16. Document titled, "Outdoor Backflow Test Log"
17. Outdoor Backflow Test Reports – 2012 (57 pages)
18. Indoor Backflow Test Reports – 2012 (73 pages)
19. Indoor Backflow Test Reports – 2013 (65 pages)
20. Organizational Chart for SCC Central Roving Team dated January 1, 2012

21. Position Description Form completed by Shawn Bottcher to describe his job duties dated May 15, 2013 (Note: unofficial)

B. DSHS Exhibits

Letter from Richard Texidor dated April 15, 2013 enclosing the following exhibits:

1. Allocation Determination letter from Richard Texidor to Shawn Bottcher dated March 28, 2013 (4 pages)
2. Position Description Form for position #EP82 received by Classification and Compensation Unit, HRD on March 5, 2013
3. Organizational chart for SCC Central Roving Team dated February 1, 2013
4. Position Action Request form for position EP82 (Shawn Bottcher) with an effective date of March 5, 2013
5. PDF for position #EP82 (Shawn Bottcher) dated November 2010
6. Email from Mike Allen, management, requesting reallocation, dated March 5, 2013
7. Plumber/Pipefitter/Steamfitter class specification
8. Plumber/Pipefitter/Steamfitter Lead class specification
9. Organizational chart for SCC Central Roving Team dated April 1, 2013

C. State HR Exhibits

1. State HR Class Specification for Plumber/Pipefitter/Steamfitter Lead, 621G
2. State HR Class Specification for Plumber/Pipefitter/Steamfitter, 621F