



STATE OF WASHINGTON
OFFICE OF FINANCIAL MANAGEMENT

STATE HUMAN RESOURCES DIVISION | DIRECTOR'S REVIEW PROGRAM
P.O. Box 40911 · Olympia, WA 98504-0911 · (360) 902-9820 · FAX (360) 586-4694

January 21, 2014

TO: Robin Ledbetter, Council Representative
Washington Federation of State Employees (WFSE)

FROM: Teresa Parsons, SPHR
Director's Review Program Supervisor

SUBJECT: Judy Brenden v. Green River Community College (GRCC)
Allocation Review Request ALLO-13-045

On November 13, 2014, I conducted a Director's review telephone conference regarding the allocation of Judy Brenden's position. You and Ms. Brenden were both present for the conference, and Barbara Iribarren, Human Resource Generalist, represented GRCC.

Director's Determination

This position review was based on the work performed for the six-month period prior to March 12, 2013, the date Ms. Brenden submitted her request for a position review to GRCC's Human Resources (HR) Office. As the Director's designee, I carefully considered all of the documentation in the file, the exhibits presented during the Director's review conference, and the verbal comments provided by both parties. Based on my review and analysis of Ms. Brenden's assigned duties and responsibilities, I conclude her position is properly allocated to the Program Coordinator classification.

Background

Ms. Brenden's position is assigned to the Campus Safety and Transportation Department at GRCC, and she reports directly to the Director, Fred Creek, who reports to the Vice President of Student Affairs. Mr. Creek also serves as the Green River Hazardous Waste Management Coordinator (Exhibit B-3).

Ms. Brenden started working for GRCC in October 2005 as a Program Assistant for Transportation. In 2007, her position was permanently assigned the duties and responsibilities of the Hazardous Waste Management Assistant to the Director, Mr. Creek. On March 12, 2013, Ms. Brenden requested a position review. At the time of her request, her position was allocated to the Program Coordinator classification. In her request, she asked that her position be reallocated to the Program Manager A classification (Exhibit B-5). On June 27, 2013, Ms.

Iribarren determined Ms. Brenden's assigned duties and responsibilities best fit the Program Coordinator classification (Exhibit B-2).

On July 2, 2013, Ms. Brenden requested a Director's review of GRCC's allocation determination (Exhibits A-1 and B-4).

Summary of Ms. Brenden's Perspective

Ms. Brenden contends she provides sole administrative support to the Campus Safety and Transportation Director/Hazardous Materials Coordinator, Mr. Creek. In that capacity, Ms. Brenden asserts her position has assumed more administrative duties, including project management, presentations to groups in the absence of her supervisor, representation of the department on committees, and responsibility for new hire orientations. In addition, Ms. Brenden states that her position interprets, advises, and implements policies and procedures for the programs in the department. Ms. Brenden contends she coordinates all aspects of the college's transportation program shuttle busses (owned by college) and vans from the state motor pool. This includes leading and directing the work of part-time, student Safety Ride Assistants and working with their schedules, approving time sheets, and billing International Programs (IP), the budget from which they are paid. Ms. Brenden contends she coordinates and maintains all billing and usage of vehicles and provides statistical data and reports to the Director, which he then uses to make budget decisions. Ms. Brenden asserts she coordinates with a site supervisor to ensure they have Drivers, and she handles all rental paperwork when college departments and organizations want to use one of the vehicles for outside activities.

In addition to transportation duties, Ms. Brenden states that she also coordinates, tracks, and monitors the disposal of hazardous waste, working with campus departments and the contractor. In total, Ms. Brenden contends her level of responsibility reaches beyond a Program Coordinator (Exhibit A-3). She emphasizes she performs all administrative functions relieving the Director of daily administrative details. Ms. Brenden asserts she works closely with the Director in developing transportation and safety processes and procedures, manages daily reports and annual contracts, and provides input and data to assist him in making program decisions. For these reasons, Ms. Brenden contends her position should be reallocated to a higher level classification such as the Program Manager A or Program Specialist classes.

Summary of GRCC's Reasoning

GRCC asserts Ms. Brenden's position independently coordinates vehicles, drivers and routes with college departments requesting transportation to and from events. GRCC states that Ms. Brenden deals directly with staff, students, and the public and is responsible for maintaining ongoing communication with drivers, staff, and college departments. GRCC recognizes that Ms. Brenden's position provides oversight to the Safety Ride Assistants and that her position handles all of the day to day coordination functions of the Campus Safety and Transportation Department. As such, GRCC contends her position processes all paperwork for each activity or event including monitoring and maintaining budget codes for billing and maintaining a log for all transportation activities. GRCC contends Ms. Brenden verifies the drivers' reporting functions during each event and ensures required preventive maintenance occurs on vehicles as scheduled. GRCC also recognizes Ms. Brenden works with International Programs (IP), the business office and payroll, and that she coordinates transportation needs for extracurricular activities, handling all rental paperwork and billing. GRCC further affirms that Ms. Brenden

independently coordinates the collection of GRCC's hazardous waste, working with the assigned contact person for each department on campus, as well as the outside contractor.

GRCC acknowledges Ms. Brenden relieves her supervisor of administrative tasks, such as managing calendars, correspondence, and reports, and that she works with internal and external groups in coordinating the daily use, rentals, billing, and maintenance of the vehicles. However, GRCC contends Ms. Brenden's position works within established procedures and has not been delegated a level of authority reaching beyond the Program Coordinator level. Overall, GRCC contends the duties and responsibilities described for Ms. Brenden's position specifically fit within the Program Coordinator classification.

Rationale for Director's Determination

The purpose of a position review is to determine which classification best describes the overall duties and responsibilities of a position. A position review is neither a measurement of the volume of work performed, nor an evaluation of the expertise with which that work is performed. A position review is a comparison of the duties and responsibilities of a particular position to the available classification specifications. This review results in a determination of the class that best describes the overall duties and responsibilities of the position. Liddle-Stamper v. Washington State University, PAB Case No. 3722-A2 (1994).

Duties and Responsibilities

The following summarizes the purpose of Ms. Brenden's position, as described on the PRR (Exhibit B-5):

- First contact for transportation issues, shuttle service, van service, and hazardous materials maintenance.
- Main contact with business and payroll offices.
- Primary purpose is to achieve department goals through coordinating activities.

In summary, the duties and responsibilities include the following (Exhibits B-5 and B-6):

30% Shuttle Buses (owned by college)

Perform all duties required for shuttle busses, which includes managing and implementing all aspects of the vehicles and preparing and maintaining reports and records. Specific tasks include reservations, scheduling, data input, billing, monitoring, resolving discrepancies, answering questions, preparing spreadsheets, and filing and organizing all paper documents (Exhibit B-5).

Serve as direct contact for shuttle bus rental requests and manage rental schedule; coordinate drivers with Campus Safety for activities and events; process and reconcile invoice billing, driver wages, and fuel expenses. Maintain reports for daily riders, trips, assist with bus maintenance and promote shuttle bus program with flyers, newsletters, events (Exhibit B-6).

30% Facility Vans (state motor pool)

Prepare and maintain all reports and records for facility vans. This includes managing all reservations, billing, state charges, and all aspects related to state motor pool vehicles (Exhibit B-5).

40% **Transportation Program (overall)**

Represent department and supervisor in daily business, staff and college meetings, outside events, and to the general public. This includes attending meetings on supervisor's behalf, public speaking, setting up events, and assignments to committees to represent transportation and safety on behalf of the department and college.

Work independently on assigned projects, prepare reports for presentations, provide advice and information, and research and proposals for expenditures. Work with various departments, programs, and vendors, including safety department, business office, payroll office, and student and international programs (Exhibit B-5).

Prepare Transportation Program newsletter, promote program with flyers and special events, promote the CLUB, anti-theft device project, act as liaison with Washington State Department of Transportation, manage materials for kiosks located at several sites on campus, submit bi-annual Commute Trip Reduction survey (Exhibit B-6)

Hazardous Waste Management

Collect weekly checklist of hazardous waste materials from college departments, maintain records of material, invoices, and annual reports, schedule routine pickup, coordinate waste compliance inspections, assist hazardous waste management related injuries (Exhibit B-6). During the Director's review conference, Ms. Brenden explained that she monitors and coordinates hazardous waste based on specific load requirements.

Ms. Brenden also provided a list detailing her duties and responsibilities, including leading and directing Safety Ride Assistants, procurement card, hazardous materials, and shuttle and van reporting (Exhibit A-4). In addition, she highlighted her duties to represent her administrator in daily business and/or meetings in his absence and oversight of day to day activities for the department. Ms. Brenden emphasized that she performs these duties independently under general direction and with little supervision (Exhibits A-3 and A-4). GRCC does not dispute Ms. Brenden's description of duties.

Class Specifications

When comparing the assignment of work and level of responsibility to the available class specifications, the class series concept (if one exists) followed by definition and distinguishing characteristics are primary considerations.

The **Program Manager A** definition states: "[s]upervises a division of a major administrative department, operating unit or program undertaking relieving the senior official of operating and administrative detail. Plans, coordinates and implements all functions required by the activity."

The Distinguishing Characteristics of the Program Manager A classification state:

Program Managers administer, supervise, direct and advise on activities involved in providing an essential management service within the institution. They are responsible for advising and assisting, with minimal direction, the senior official and other administrators in the organization on matters pertaining to the program. The primary purpose of these positions is to achieve the goals and objectives of the program by providing, obtaining, and/or coordinating activities as they affect the institution.

Positions in this class involve a wide scope of complex duties and responsibilities in the management of a program which may involve a combination of two or more of the following services: Project management, funds management, contract administration, management analysis, property management, space management, program management, budget planning, public information, faculty, administrative, classified staff and student services administration, personnel administration, and staff supervision.

Program Managers exercise independent judgment, and have been delegated decision-making authority. Program manager at the "A" level are typically first-line supervisors, and are characterized by their total responsibility for a program or management services to an administrative supervisor.

The State Human Resources Division's Glossary of Classification Terms provides further guidance on the level and scope of work performed by Program Managers as follows:

Program Manager. Duties involve authority over:

- Developing program goals and objectives.
- Developing timetables and work plans to achieve program goals and objectives.
- Developing program policies and procedures.
- Preparing program budgets, adjusting allotments and authorizing expenditures.
- Controlling allocation of program resources.
- Setting and adjusting program priorities.
- Evaluating program effectiveness.

Ms. Brenden's position does not exercise the scope or breadth of authority anticipated at the Program Manager level. Her position has not been assigned responsibility for supervising a division of a major administrative department or program. The majority of her work involves coordinating the day-to-day functions related to the bus shuttle and van services, which includes scheduling, monitoring, and tracking program activities. While Ms. Brenden performs lead responsibilities over the Safety Ride Assistants, she has not been assigned full supervisory responsibilities. Further, while Ms. Brenden develops work processes and tracks program data, her position has not been delegated responsibility for developing program goals, policies or budgets, though she does provide information and input to her supervisor for decision-making. Overall, the scope and complexity of her duties are limited and do not rise to the level of responsibility required by the Program Manger A class.

The **Program Specialist** Class Series Concept states, in part, the following:

Positions in this series coordinate discrete, specialized programs consisting of specific components and tasks that are unique to a particular subject and are separate and distinguished from the main body of an organization. . . .

Examples of program areas may include but are not limited to: business enterprises, fund raising, volunteer services, community resources, election administration and certification, juvenile delinquency prevention, recreational education and safety, energy education, aeronautic operations and safety, student housing, financial aid, and registration.

The **Program Specialist 2** definition reads as follows:

Positions at this level work under general supervision and plan, organize, direct and coordinate operations for programs such as the business enterprise, volunteer services and community resources, elections examination/administration programs. Incumbents oversee day-to-day program operations, function as the program representative and resource, have extensive contact with program participants and outside entities, and resolve problems within a delegated area of authority. Unusual problems, probable outcomes and solutions are presented to higher levels for resolution. Incumbents may be delegated limited authority to approve budget expenditures and may assist higher-level staff with developing and coordinating statewide program activities.

I realize there is overlap in the description of duties for both the Program Specialist 2 and Program Coordinator classes. However, when considering the two classes, Ms. Brenden's duties and level of responsibility more closely align with the Program Coordinator class.

Positions allocated to the Program Specialist series have independent responsibility for planning, organizing, directing and coordinating operations for specialized programs such as financial aid and registration, which requires a higher degree of specialized knowledge and complexity unique to a particular subject. Incumbents coordinate services and resources, assess program needs, and develop courses of action to carry out program functions and activities. Ms. Brenden's position does not fully meet this level of responsibility. Instead, the coordinating functions assigned to Ms. Brenden's position involve complex scheduling, tracking, and monitoring of program activities at a level consistent with the Program Coordinator class.

The **Program Coordinator** states that positions "[c]oordinate the operation of a specialized or technical program." The distinguishing characteristics include the following:

Under general direction, perform work using knowledge and experience specific to the program. Exercise independent judgment in interpreting and applying rules and regulations. Independently advise students, staff, program participants and/or the public regarding program content, policies, procedures and activities; select/recommend alternative courses of action and either:

Project, monitor, maintain, initiate and/or approve expenditures on program budgets.

OR

Have extensive involvement with students, staff, the public and/or agencies in carrying out program activities, and coordinate, schedule and monitor program activities to determine consistency with program goals.

Ms. Brenden's position has been tasked with coordinating the day-to-day functions in GRCC's Campus Safety and Transportation Department, including scheduling and processing all paperwork, monitoring and maintaining budget codes for billing, and logging and tracking program activities and expenditures related to bus shuttle and van services. Ms. Brenden also coordinates with departments for the removal of hazardous waste. In performing her duties, Ms. Brenden works under general direction, as indicated by the Program Coordinator distinguishing characteristics, and she independently advises students, staff, program participants and the general public about transportation services. Her position carries out program activities consistent with program goals, and she provides input to her supervisor regarding policy and budget issues. Overall, the preponderance of duties and scope of responsibility assigned to her position best fit this classification.

While examples of typical work identified in a class specification do not form the basis for an allocation, they lend support to the work envisioned within a classification. The following typical work examples best align with the work assigned to Ms. Brenden's position:

- Monitor budget status in line with program activities, plans or priorities; maintain program budgets and initiate corrective action; sign vouchers; receive, process and deposit funds . . .;
- Provide information and advice to students, staff, program participants and/or the public regarding program content, policies and activities, recommend alternative courses of action; promote the program on campus with outside organizations;
- Attend meetings and/or conferences as program representative;
- Confer regularly with representatives of off-campus organizations and agencies regarding the interpretation and implementation of program and institutional policies;
- Monitor program activities in relation to established program goals; within established program parameters . . .;
- Perform complex scheduling including independently prioritizing needs of program clients;
- Direct the work of others;
- Perform the duties of Program Assistant;
- May make public presentations related to program specialty.

It is clear Ms. Brenden's work is highly valued by the Campus Safety and Transportation Department and GRCC. A position's allocation is not based on an evaluation of performance or an individual's ability to perform higher-level work. Rather, it is based on the majority of work assigned to a position and how that work best aligns with the available job classes.

Further, the Personnel Resources Board has previously determined that most positions within the civil service system occasionally perform duties that appear in more than one classification. However, when determining the appropriate classification for a specific position, the duties and responsibilities of that position must be considered in their entirety and the position must be allocated to the classification that provides the best fit overall for

the majority of the position's duties and responsibilities. Dudley v. Dept. of Labor and Industries, PRB Case No. R-ALLO-07-007 (2007).

The overall scope of duties and level of responsibility assigned to Ms. Brenden's position at the time relevant to this review best fit the Program Coordinator classification.

Appeal Rights

RCW 41.06.170 governs the right to appeal. RCW 41.06.170(4) provides, in relevant part, the following:

An employee incumbent in a position at the time of its allocation or reallocation, or the agency utilizing the position, may appeal the allocation or reallocation to the Washington personnel resources board. Notice of such appeal must be filed in writing within thirty days of the action from which appeal is taken.

The mailing address for the Personnel Resources Board (PRB) is P.O. Box 40911, Olympia, Washington, 98504-0911. The PRB Office is located on the 4th floor of the Insurance Building, 302 Sid Snyder Avenue SW, Olympia, Washington. The main telephone number is (360) 902-9820, and the fax number is (360) 586-4694.

If no further action is taken, the Director's determination becomes final.

c: Judy Brenden
Barbara Iribarren, GRCC
Lisa Skriletz, SHR

Enclosure: List of Exhibits

JUDY BRENDEN v GRCC
ALLO-13-045

A. Judy Brenden Exhibits

1. Director's Review form received July 2, 2013 (2 pages)
2. June 27, 2013 GRCC allocation determination cover letter (2 pages)
3. J. Brenden response to determination letter (1 page)
4. J. Brenden list of Upper Level work being performed (1 page)
5. GRCC Performance Assessment 2012-13 (3 pages)
6. Worksheet for Vans Special Events (3 pages)
7. Worksheet for Shuttle Bus Special Events (3 pages)
8. GRCC Deposit Form (1 page)
9. Enterprise Reservation Confirmation (2 pages)

B. GRCC Exhibits

1. June 27, 2013 GRCC allocation determination cover letter (1 page – same as exhibit A-2)
2. June 27, 2013 GRCC allocation determination letter (2 pages)
3. Campus Safety Organizational Chart
4. Director's Review form received July 2, 2013 (2 pages – same as exhibit A-1)
5. Position Review Request, dated March 12, 2013
6. GRCC Position Description

C. Class Specifications

1. Program Coordinator Class Specification
2. Program Manager A Class Specification
3. Program Specialist 2 Class Specification