STATE OF WASHINGTON
OFFICE OF FINANCIAL MANAGEMENT
STATE HUMAN RESOURCES DIVISION | DIRECTOR'S REVIEW PROGRAM
P.O. Box 40911 · Olympia, WA 98504-0911 · (360) 407-4101 · FAX (360) 586-4694

May 27, 2015

TO: Connie Goff, PHR
Rules and Appeals Program Manager

FROM: Kris Brophy
Director's Review Program Investigator

SUBJECT: Coy Chappell v. Department of Enterprise Services (DES)
Allocation Review Request ALLO-14-054

Director's Determination

This position review was based on the work performed for the six-month period prior to March 5, 2014, the date DES Human Resources Office (DES HR) received Mr. Chappell's request for a position review. As the Director's designee, I carefully considered all of the documentation in the file, the exhibits presented during the Director's review conference, and the verbal comments provided by both parties. Based on my review and analysis of Mr. Chappell's duties and responsibilities, I conclude his position is properly allocated to the Procurement and Supply Specialist 2 (PSS 2) classification.

Background

Mr. Chappell submitted a Position Review Request (PRR) form for his position on March 5, 2014, requesting that his PSS 2 position be reallocated to the Procurement and Supply Specialist 3 (PSS 3) class (Exhibit B-6).

DES HR conducted a position review and notified Mr. Chappell on June 10, 2014 that hIs position was properly allocated to the PSS 2 class (Exhibit B-1).

On June 13, 2014, Mr. Chappell filed an appeal with State HR requesting reallocation to the PSS 3 class (Exhibit A-1).

On April 27, 2015, I conducted a review conference with the parties. Present for the conference were Coy Chappell, Stacie Leanos, Council Representative, WFSE; Tony Kennish, Shop Steward, DES; Bryan Bazard, Fleet Manager, DES; and Kristin Kaphan, Human Resource Consultant, DES.

Rationale for Director's Determination

The purpose of a position review is to determine which classification best describes the overall duties and responsibilities of a position. A position review is neither a measurement of the volume of work performed, nor an evaluation of the expertise with which that work is performed. A position review is a comparison of the duties and responsibilities of a particular position to the available classification specifications. This review results in a determination of the class that best describes the overall duties and responsibilities of the position. Liddle-Stamper v. Washington State University, PAB Case No. 3722-A2 (1994).

Duties and Responsibilities

Mr. Chappell works for the Fleet Maintenance Shop located within Fleet Operations of DES. His position is responsible for procuring, storing, issuing, and inventory control of automotive replacement parts and supplies for the shop. His position requisitions shop tools, automotive supplies and parts using state contracts. His position also has primary responsibility for scheduling vehicles into the maintenance shop for service and repairs.

His duties are described in the PRR (Exhibit B-6) as follows:

50% **Duty**

Phone, walk-in and E-mail scheduling, greet the customer upon arrival, maintain the schedule during the day, contact customer with updated information regarding delays with their service or repairs. Assign services to the Technicians.

Tasks

Talking with customers to determine if it's repairs or service that's needed.

35% **Duty**

Support technicians locating and purchasing parts, supplies and materials from state contracts, non-contract vendors, and OEM vendors. Perform research on items, maintain and inventory the parts room at Fleet Operations Shop.

Tasks

Worked closely with the technicians to determine the best product for their needs. Keeping them informed of the status on parts ordered.

15% **Duty**

Instruct staff on proper state procurement and supply management functions. Identified products that were consistently purchased and analyzed the benefits of adding products to the warehouse. Developed procurement related training to successfully implement new procedures to improve efficiencies in the area of inventory, operations, and supply management. Worked closely with the technicians to determine the best product for their needs while at the same time keeping within budget guidelines and contract agreements. Make sure all applicable RCWs, WACs, and General Authorities are being followed. Provide assistance to outside customers and vendors as needed.

Tasks

Knowledge of RCW's, WAC's and General Authorities, Sub Objects and Sub-Sub

Objects or the ability to find the answer if not readily known.

Mr. Chappell's supervisor is Mr. Kim Svidran, Equipment Technician 5. Mr. Svidran completed the Supervisor Portion of the PRR, and disagrees with a portion of Mr. Chappell's description of his assigned duties and responsibilities. Mr. Svidran indicates that Mr. Chappell does not have supervisory responsibility in his position in that he does not participate in annual performance evaluations, employee hiring, or taking corrective action.

He indicates that Mr. Chappell has the following decision making authority:

- schedules vehicles into the shop for service or repair needs;
- creates work orders and assigns work to the technicians;
- purchases, issues and tracks automotive parts and shop supplies;
- sublets work to outside vendors when the shop is overbooked or short staffed and creates work orders for that purpose;
- maintains daily work shop work schedules;
- posts daily purchasing activity to US Bank on the line transaction list, and
- presents the monthly end credit card statement for review.

Mr. Svidran indicates that Mr. Chappell must receive his approval for vehicle reassignments or disposal and major vehicle repair expenditures, major shop equipment purchases, and training.

Summary of the Employee's Comments

Mr. Chappell asserts his position meets the PSS 3 class on the basis that the majority of his day is spent supervising technicians while performing complex procurement activities for the Fleet Maintenance Shop.

Summary of DES's Reasoning

DES asserts that while the scope of Mr. Chappell's position reaches the requirements of the Definition of the PSS 3 class, the scope of his duties do not fully reach the requirements of the Distinguishing Characteristics.

DES states that Mr. Chappell's position does not involve large or complex purchasing projects. He does not have authority to modify and adapt purchasing and supply management procedures to accommodate specialized or unusual acquisitions. He does not prepare and develop original contract terms and evaluation criteria to ensure vendor contract and compliance. He does not coordinate purchasing activities with clients to resolve vendor problems.

DES asserts the majority of Mr. Chappell's duties do not reach the level specified in the Distinguishing Characteristics of the PSS 3 class. DES believes the PSS 2 class is the appropriate allocation for Mr. Chappell's position.

Class Specifications

When comparing the assignment of work and level of responsibility to the available class specifications, the class series concept (if one exists) followed by definition and distinguishing characteristics are primary considerations.

Comparison of duties to Procurement and Supply Specialist 3

The Definition for this class states:

> Responsible and accountable for the procurement of services, supplies, materials, parts and equipment for an agency, institution or facility or on behalf of client agencies, institutions, colleges and universities in accordance with state laws and requirements. Responsible and accountable for supply management functions, including receipt, storage, issue, and transfer of materials and property.

The Distinguishing Characteristics for this class state:

> These positions have delegated authority to take independent action and to conduct highly complex purchasing projects involving unique services and/or technical commodities purchasing. Activities include developing specifications for large, complex or unusual procurement projects such as major relocation projects, computer systems, and communication systems for which specifications involving unique or customized material requirements, feature, or performance standards must be defined.
>
> This level is expected to make sourcing decisions based on extensive knowledge of procurement and supply practices.
>
> These positions have authority to modify and adapt purchasing and supply management procedures and/or processes to accommodate specialized or unusual acquisitions. Positions prepare and develop original contract terms, evaluation criteria, analytical tools and procedures to assess and ensure vendor contract performance and compliance. Coordinates purchasing activities with clients to develop specifications and to resolve vendor performance problems.

Mr. Chappell plans, coordinates, and supports the supply management functions for the Fleet Maintenance shop, including the receipt, storage, issuance, and transfer of automotive parts, tools and supplies. He evaluates parts and supplies usage data and determines appropriate inventory levels. He is responsible for determining appropriate economic order quantities for parts, supplies and equipment. However, Mr. Chappell's position does not fully reach the higher level allocating criteria of this class.

For example, Mr. Chappell's position has not been delegated authority to independently conduct highly-complex purchasing projects involving unique services and/or technical commodities purchasing. Procurement activities at this level include developing specifications for large, complex or unusual procurement projects such as major relocation projects, computer systems, and communication systems for which specifications involving unique or customized material requirements, feature, or performance standards must be defined. Mr. Chappell is not regularly

responsible for preparing and developing original contract terms and specifications, evaluation criteria, analytical tools and procedures to assess and ensure vendor contract performance and compliance at the level intended by this class.

In addition, the majority of his procurement activities do not regularly require him to make sourcing decisions to determine the appropriate procurement method to use such as competitive bids, sole source acquisitions, and requests for bid proposals or direct negotiations.

Further, Mr. Chappell does not originate and chair client committees and evaluate input relative to specifications development and contract awards. The majority of his purchasing work does not require originating and finalizing competitive solicitation documents for long term agreements and/or one time purchases. His position does not require him to perform market analysis and customer needs assessment studies. He does not have authority to independently make decisions with significant fiscal impact for the shop.

In addition, his position does not regularly direct the selection of interested and qualified vendors for bid distribution at the level anticipated by this class. During the review conference Mr. Bazard clarified that the majority of Mr. Chappell's procurement activities do not require him to conduct pre-bid conferences and provide direction to interested bidders. His position has limited latitude to modify and adapt purchasing and supply management procedures and/or processes to accommodate specialized or unusual acquisitions. The specialty items Mr. Chappell procures primarily involve locating suppliers and generally securing phone bids for the special equipment or parts. For example, Mr. Chappell stated that during the review conference he completed a purchasing project that involved the purchase of a $4,000 electronic computerized automotive scanning tool that is used to check and diagnose engine operation. For that project Mr. Chappell located seven vendors who submitted bids which included an onsite demonstration of the equipment. During the review period he also procured a brake rotor lathe and a tire machine which both included three verbal quotes from vendors. The overall scope of these procurement activities fall more in line with the PSS 2 level class.

As a whole, the majority of Mr. Chappell's work involves procuring auto parts, supplies and equipment for the Fleet Maintenance Shop. Further, as stated in the DES allocation determination, Mr. Chappell's level of responsibility regarding the purchase of more technical vehicle parts such as computer controlled devices related to the engine, body, brakes and tires make up about 20 to 30 percent of his purchases.

In total, Mr. Chappell's scope and level of purchase responsibility and decision making authority do not reach the scope of complexity, level of independent decision making authority, and level of control anticipated by the Definition and Distinguishing Characteristics of this class. The Procurement and Supply Specialist 3 is not the best fit for Mr. Chappell's position.

For these reasons Mr. Chappell's position should not be reallocated to the PSS 3 class.

<u>Comparison of Duties to Procurement and Supply Specialist 2</u>

The Definition for the PSS 2 class states:

> Plans, coordinates, and performs procurement of services, supplies, materials, parts and equipment for an agency, institution or facility or on behalf of client agencies, institutions, colleges and universities in accordance with state laws and

> requirements. Maintains inventory and accountability functions of purchased items or services.

The Distinguishing Characteristics for this class states:

> Under general supervision, conducts purchasing projects for specialized commodity areas. Activities include analysis of bids for multi-commodity purchase contracts and/or procurement of products, development of specifications and analysis of bids for products and services. Resolves vendor performance problems.

Mr. Chappell's assigned duties closely match responsibilities described by the Definition and Distinguishing Characteristics for the Procurement and Supply Specialist 2. Mr. Chappell plans and coordinates the purchasing activities of the DES Fleet Operations Maintenance Shop. This includes the procurement, payment, receipt, storage, and inventory of automotive parts, supplies, tools and other related equipment. He conducts purchasing projects for specialized automotive parts and equipment.

A portion of his work includes developing specifications and analyzing bids for automotive products at a level consistent with this class. For example, Mr. Chappell determines available sources of supply and conducts research for new sources of supply for tools and special parts as needed. He locates and contacts vendors and suppliers. He ensures specifications are adequate for the parts and supplies needed. For higher cost items he analyzes phone or written bids for compliance with specifications. Mr. Chappell also arranges for, conducts and/or directs tests and product sampling to ensure compliance with specifications. He also resolves vendor performance problems.

Further, while examples of typical work identified in a class specification do not form the basis for an allocation, they lend support to the work envisioned within a classification. The typical work statements that most closely align with the employees' duties and responsibilities include:

> Prepares and implements the agency's or institution's procedures relative to supply functions; collects and evaluates supply and equipment usage data; projects departmental supply needs; determines optimum stock levels, maximum authorizations, standard unit pack, and reorder points;
>
> Assists in coordination or is responsible for maintenance of equipment registers and master inventory records;
>
> Receives, examines and determines need for, and adequacy of, requisitioned items and approves requests or makes appropriate recommendations dependent upon availability of funds or other considerations;
>
> Determines that specifications are adequate for commodities used; determines available sources of supply;
>
> Analyzes bids for compliance with bid specifications with complex variables; Conducts research for new sources of supply; locates and contacts vendors and suppliers;

> Analyzes history of performance by suppliers and quality of goods and services;
>
> Arranges for, conducts and/or directs tests and product sampling to ensure compliance with specifications;
>
> Interviews vendors, business representatives and departmental/institutional officials regarding purchasing in assigned commodity areas; provides information in response to inquiries;
>
> …;

Mr. Chappell's duties are fully consistent with these statements. He plans, coordinates and develops bids which include determining appropriate specifications for parts and tools used in the shop, and specialized parts for client vehicles. He plays an integral role in ensuring quality service for purchasing responsibilities in the Fleet Maintenance Shop.

Mr. Chappell implements the shop's supply function procedures. He collects and evaluates supply and equipment usage data and projects the shop's supply needs and determines and maintains inventory and inventory records.

Mr. Chappell's responsibilities are at the level of independence and responsibility encompassed in the Procurement and Supply Specialist 2 class. His duties best align with the scope, intent and level of responsibility found in the PSS 2 class. This includes performing special parts procurement specific to Fleet Operations Maintenance Shop services.

Therefore, his position should remain allocated to the Procurement and Supply Specialist 2 classification.

Appeal Rights

RCW 41.06.170 governs the right to appeal. RCW 41.06.170(4) provides, in relevant part, the following:

> An employee incumbent in a position at the time of its allocation or reallocation, or the agency utilizing the position, may appeal the allocation or reallocation to the Washington personnel resources board. Notice of such appeal must be filed in writing within thirty days of the action from which appeal is taken.

The mailing address for the Personnel Resources Board is P.O. Box 40911, Olympia, Washington, 98504-0911. The PRB Office is located on the 3rd floor of the Raad Building, 128 10th Avenue SW, Olympia, Washington. The main telephone number is (360) 407-4101, and the fax number is (360) 586-4694.

If no further action is taken, the Director's determination becomes final.

c: Coy Chappell
Stacie Leanos, WFSE
Kristin Kaphan, DES

Enclosure: List of Exhibits

COY CHAPPELL v DES

ALLO-14-054

List of Exhibits

A. Coy Chappell Exhibits

1. Request for Director's Review
2. DES allocation determination letter
3. Position Review Request Employee Portion
4. Position Review Request Supervisor Portion
5. Position Description Form
6. Class Specification for Procurement and Supply Specialist 2
7. Class Specification for Procurement and Supply Specialist 3
8. Organizational Chart
9. Examples of work in higher classification
10. Job Class Questionnaire

B. DES Exhibits

1. Allocation determination letter
2. Position Description Form
3. Organizational Chart
4. Procurement and Supply Specialist 2 Class Specification
5. Procurement and Supply Specialist 3 Class Specification
6. Position Review Request – employee portion
7. Position Review Request – supervisor portion
8. Position Description Form – submitted by employee for reallocation
9. Questionnaire completed by supervisor