



STATE OF WASHINGTON
OFFICE OF FINANCIAL MANAGEMENT

STATE HUMAN RESOURCES DIVISION | DIRECTOR'S REVIEW PROGRAM
P.O. Box 40911 · Olympia, WA 98504-0911 · (360) 407-4101 · FAX (360) 586-4694

August 6, 2015

TO: Connie Goff, PHR
Rules and Appeals Program Manager

FROM: Meredith Huff, SPHR, MPA
Director's Review Program Investigator

SUBJECT: Raoul Perez v Yakima Valley College (YVC)
Allocation Review Request ALLO-15-010

DIRECTOR'S DETERMINATION

This position review was based on the work performed for the six-month period prior to July 24, 2014, the date YVC's Human Resources Office received a request for a review of Mr. Perez's position. As the Director's Review Investigator, I considered the documentation and information provided by the parties. Based on my review and analysis of Mr. Perez's assigned duties and responsibilities, I conclude his position is correctly allocated to the Maintenance Mechanic 2 classification.

BACKGROUND

On July 24, 2014, YVC's Human Resources office received a request for a review of Mr. Perez's position. Mr. Perez suggested his position be reallocated from Maintenance Mechanic 2 to the Heating, Ventilation, & Air Conditioning [HVAC] Technician classification.

By letter dated January 8, 2015, Mr. Mark Rogstad, Director, Human Resources and Affirmative Action Services for YVC, notified Mr. Perez that his position was properly allocated to the Maintenance Mechanic 2 classification.

On February 3, 2015, the State HR Director's Review Program received Mr. Perez's Request for a Director's Review of the allocation determination.

On June 23, 2015, a phone review conference was held with the following participants:

Raoul Perez, Employee
Steve Sloniker, Representative, WPEA
Mark Rogstad, Director, Human Resources and Affirmative Action
Jeannette Quintero, Human Resource Consultant Assistant
Casey Rice, Supervisor, Assistant Director of Physical Operations

SUMMARY OF MR. PEREZ'S PERSPECTIVE

Position Review Request

The Position Review Request (PRR) (Exhibit B-2) was signed on July 24, 2014 by Mr. Perez. He described his position's purpose as:

"My position provides a critical service to the college by maintaining and repairing the heating and cooling systems. Without this position, staff, students and faculty would be impacted by an environment not conducive to the college's mission. The position plays a critical role on campus by maintaining not only the building climate control, but also refrigeration equipment used by food services and the biology department."

Mr. Perez summarized his major duties and the percent of work time he performs them as follows:

- 88%** HVAC/R maintenance and repair.
- 6%** E-mails and other computer usage. Check e-mails, order parts, log in hrs. worked.
- 6%** Assist co-workers. Event setups, tables and chairs and assist with heavy lifting.

Mr. Perez noted the following comments on his responsibilities:

Decision Making Authority: Repairing and purchasing parts to get the piece of equipment back up and running. Well, these decisions are not difficult or complex for me.

List examples of decisions that require approval: Replacing complete systems that come with a higher price tag and becomes a project.

Mr. Perez indicated he does not have responsibility to lead or supervise others; he does not have budget or fiscal responsibilities.

He believes the following duties are a better fit to the Heating, Ventilation and Air Conditioning Technician class:

"Install, maintain, diagnose and repair all of the HVAC/R units throughout Yakima Valley Community College campus, as well as the remote campuses operated by the college. Work is performed on large chillers, air-handlers, dual-duct systems, commercial refrigeration equipment, fire alarm systems and energy management systems."

During the review conference, Mr. Perez discussed his work which includes checking the DDC to see if there are problems with any of the campus systems. Mr. Perez described the DDC as a computerized program that connects to 99% of the campus equipment. Mr. Perez indicated that in addition to servicing and repairing HVAC systems and equipment, he repairs and services other equipment. He repairs walk-in coolers and refrigeration units in the campus kitchens; fire alarms systems; circuit boards; electrical problems; plumbing, and roof fans. He assists in changing filters, repairs or replaces roof compressors and refrigerant, as necessary, and troubleshoots campus automatic indoor and outdoor lighting that is controlled by DDC. When he locates glitches in the DDC program, he notifies the contractor and they follow up. When there

are special events, he updates the lighting schedule/program to make sure that the necessary lights are on. He is responsible for checking and repairing fire alarm systems and smoke detectors. He noted he calls ahead to the fire station to let them know he is working on alarms.

Mr. Perez indicated that as he is working on campus, frequently he will notice something that needs to be taken care of or repaired. Once he has fixed the problem, he will make a note of that in his pocket notebook. When he returns to the office, he will create a work order for that repair and mark it complete. If it is a busy day or week, it may be several days before he has an opportunity to record all of his self-generated work orders into the MegaMation system.

Mr. Perez indicated he feels the HVAC Technician is the best classification for his position as he spends a majority of his work time performing diagnostic tests, updating and maintaining that system and equipment.

SUMMARY OF SUPERVISOR'S COMMENTS (Exhibit B-3)

Position Review Request, Supervisor's Portion

Mr. Casey Rice, supervisor, completed the PRR, Supervisor Portion, for Mr. Perez's position. Regarding the employee's description of the Position Purpose, Mr. Rice stated:

"..... The current employee structure of the maintenance department is one Maintenance Specialist, one Electrician, four Maintenance Mechanic IIs and one Maintenance Mechanic 1. The maintenance classifications allow for diversity among skilled trades to best serve the operational needs of the college. In the Maintenance Mechanic II positions the employees are skilled in various trades such as plumbing, carpentry, doors and windows. The Maintenance Mechanic 1 provides preventive maintenance on HVAC equipment and vehicle maintenance."

Mr. Rice observed that he disagreed with the employee's description of duties and questioned some of Mr. Perez's stated work time and work tasks recorded in the work order tracking system, MegaMations. He wrote, in part:

"Mr. Perez states that 88% of his time is spent on HVAC maintenance and repair. ...While reviewing Mr. Perez's work hours that were recorded in the MegaMations work order tracking system most all of his work assignments were given a generic 8 hours to complete. This is not typical recording of time on task for work order assignments. While some larger work projects may take a significant amount of time to complete, simply recording 8 hours for each given work assignment or work order does not accurately reflect the actual time it takes to complete the task. Many of the work orders were self-assigned by Mr. Perez."

Regarding decisions, Mr. Rice stated: "Mr. Perez is able [to] diagnose equipment, troubleshoot problems, and order repair parts as needed to maintain equipment in working order. This is standard for all maintenance staff."

Mr. Rice described the purchasing process that requires supervisory approval for Mr. Perez's purchases:

"All maintenance employees purchase and order repair parts for college owned equipment and generally notify their supervisor before the items are purchased. The most common method of purchasing is using the procurement card or the Purchase Order system. All

procurement cards are checked out, and at that time the Supervisor is normally informed of the purchase being made. Purchase Orders are drafted by the office personnel and a description of the item is listed on the paperwork and requires a supervisor's signature. If it is a large scale purchase, multiple signatures are needed for approval." (Exhibit B-3)

Mr. Rice indicated that he provides supervision at the "general direction level" for Mr. Perez's position. Mr. Perez's second-level supervisor, Mr. Jeff Wood, agreed with Mr. Rice's statements.

During the review conference, Mr. Rice indicated that Mr. Perez's specialty area is HVAC. He commented that other employees have a specialty such as electric, plumbing, carpenter with door and window specialties, and interior carpet specialist. Because YVC is a small college, there is not enough work for full time specialists so the employees with specialties assist each other in areas other than the specialty. He stated that YVC is a small campus and it works well to have employees working together to cover all the work.

Mr. Rice observed that Mr. Perez has a broader scope of work than just HVAC. He may repair dishwashers, clean roof drains, repair the fire alarm system, or add a new cord to a vacuum cleaner or buffer. He noted Mr. Perez has worked on elevators, completed repairs in the pottery studio and participated in snow removal efforts.

Mr. Rice indicated that his analysis of Mr. Perez's work hours and work tickets, for the time period of this review, indicate that Mr. Perez spends less than 50% of his work time on HVAC issues. The analysis shows the following breakdown of work time:

HVAC – 38%; DDC – 27%; Other – 19%; Leave – 10%; Training – 7%. (Exhibit B-4)

SUMMARY OF YVC's HUMAN RESOURCES DETERMINATION (Exhibit B-1)

Mr. Mark Rogstad, Director of Human Resource Services, in a memo dated January 8, 2015, responded to Mr. Perez's position review request. He wrote in part:

"It appears the incumbent spends at or above 50% of his time engaged in work activities which fit within this broad range of work commonly described as HVAC. It is difficult, if not impossible however, to accurately determine how much the incumbent's time is spent on the type of HVAC work which fits within the Maintenance Mechanic series versus the type of HVAC work which fits the Technician classification, and more especially what degree of specialization and complexity is required.

Based on this criteria in isolation, it would appear the position should be reallocated to the more specific HVAC Technician classification. Upon closer review, however, when the specific limitations contained in the Distinguishing Characteristic of the HVAC Technician classification are considered, the intended scope of the position as used by the College includes a broader scope of work and does not meet the eligibility criteria listed in the more specialized Department of Personnel HVAC Technician classification. Where there is a Distinguishing Characteristic available, it would appear to be a controlling factor when allocating the position."

During the review conference, Mr. Rogstad, stated that he found the Maintenance Mechanic 2 class is the best fit for the broad range of technical repairs and assignments that Mr. Perez performs.

GUIDANCE FOR DIRECTOR'S DETERMINATION

When comparing the assignment of work and level of responsibility to the available class specifications, the Class Series Concept (if one exists) followed by Definition and Distinguishing characteristics are primary considerations. While examples of Typical Work identified in a class specification do not form the basis for an allocation, they lend support to the work envisioned within a classification.

The purpose of a position review is to determine which classification best describes the overall duties and responsibilities of a position. A position review is neither a measurement of the volume of work performed, nor an evaluation of the expertise with which that work is performed. A position review is a comparison of the duties and responsibilities of a particular position to the available classification specifications. This review results in a determination of the class that best describes the overall duties and responsibilities of the position. *Liddle-Stamper v. Washington State University*, PAB Case No. 3722-A2 (1994).

COMPARISON OF DUTIES TO CLASS SPECIFICATIONS

HEATING VENTILATION & AIR CONDITION (HVAC) TECHNICIAN (621J)

There is no Class Series Concept for the HVAC Technician Series.

Definition

Responsible for heating, ventilation, and air conditioning equipment (HVAC) systems for assigned multi-locations which include the performance of skilled work in diagnostic testing, repair and maintenance of HVAC and steam distribution systems.

Distinguishing Characteristics

Positions allocated to this class will be limited to designated HVAC units having the responsibility for multiple institutions, such as Consolidated Support Services in the Department of Social and Health Services.

Mr. Perez has responsibility for maintenance and service of heating, ventilation, and air conditioning equipment and systems as anticipated in the Definition of this class. However, he is not responsible for HVAC systems at *multi-locations* as required by the Definition. Further, the Distinguishing Characteristics require that positions allocated to this class are limited to having responsibility for designated HVAC units at *multiple institutions*.

Overall, the scope and assigned responsibilities of Mr. Perez's position, does not meet the intent of this class Definition and Distinguishing Characteristics. Mr. Perez is not responsible for repair and maintenance of HVAC and steam distribution systems in multi-locations for multiple institutions. Rather, Mr. Perez's work assignments are specific to the YVC's campuses. Further, the focus of Mr. Perez's work is not limited to HVAC systems. He also has responsibility for DDC and refrigeration units in the kitchen. He assists others with work orders for a broad range of technical repairs. For example, he may assist others in plumbing, carpentry, and fire alarms repairs and events set up. Overall, this class is not a best fit for the allocation for Mr. Perez's duties. His position should not be allocated to the Heating, Ventilation & Air Conditioning class.

Class Series Concept for Maintenance Mechanic classes is on Maintenance Mechanic 1 (626J)

Class Series Concept

Positions in this series perform general maintenance, repair, remodeling and construction duties utilizing working knowledge of several related skill fields such as electrical, plumbing, carpentry, welding, painting and machinist work. Incumbents inspect, repair, install and maintain physical facilities, locks and maintain and repair machinery and equipment. Positions may be required to lead or supervise and instruct offenders, inmates or residents in general maintenance activities.

Mr. Perez's position's responsibilities are aligned with the intent of this class series concept which is to perform a variety of general maintenance, repair and construction activities requiring a working knowledge of a variety of skill fields. Mr. Perez's position should be allocated within this class series.

MAINTENANCE MECHANIC 3 (626L)

Definition

This is the senior, specialist or lead worker level of the series. Positions at this level perform skilled work in more than one trade or craft. Incumbents typically specialize in one trade or craft but perform journey-level and semi-skilled work in a variety of disciplines. Incumbents perform construction, maintenance, repair and modification of buildings, facilities, mechanical equipment, machinery and specific apparatus and utilize a working knowledge of several related skill fields such as plumbing, electrical, welding, carpentry, and machinist work.

The Glossary of Classification Terms is found on the web at:

http://www.hr.wa.gov/sitecollectiondocuments/compensationandjobclasses/comp_class_hr_pro_tools/classificationglossary.doc

The "*Glossary of Classification Terms*" defines "**lead**" as follows:

"Lead. An employee who performs the same or similar duties as other employees in his/her work group and has the designated responsibility to regularly assign, instruct, and check the work of those employees on an ongoing basis."

Mr. Perez does not direct the work of other employees on work orders or projects. His position does not have designated responsibility to lead the work of others on a regular and ongoing basis.

The *Glossary of Classification Terms* defines "**senior**" as:

"**Senior** - The performance of work requiring the consistent application of advanced knowledge and requiring a skilled and experienced practitioner to function independently. Senior-level work includes devising methods and processes to resolve complex or difficult issues that have broad potential impact. These issues typically involve competing interests, multiple clients, conflicting rules or practices, a range of possible solutions, or other elements that contribute to complexity. The senior-level has full authority to plan, prioritize,

and handle all duties within an assigned area of responsibility. Senior-level employees require little supervision and their work is not typically checked by others. “

The overall scope and complexity of Mr. Perez's assigned duties with respect to his decision making authority do not reach senior level responsibility. His work typically does not involve competing interests, multiple clients, conflicting rules or practices, nor a range of possible solutions or other elements that contribute to complexity.

It is understood that Mr. Perez performs skilled trades work. He independently devises methods and processes to resolve issues or situations that arise with respect to his assigned work. His knowledge, skills and experience allow him to independently perform skilled work on chillers, air handling units, and refrigeration systems.

However, the work that Mr. Perez performs does not require him to independently devise methods and processes to resolve complex or difficult issues. He is not assigned responsibility for making decisions that carry high consequences of error relative to work orders and other maintenance projects.

Additionally, Mr. Perez's position does not have full senior-level responsibility to plan, prioritize, and handle all duties within his assigned area of responsibility. For example, Mr. Perez does not have responsibility for approving major deviations to his work assignments. He does not have authority to make large or expensive purchases to complete repair work without his supervisor's approval. This limits the level of authority Mr. Perez has to plan, prioritize, and handle all duties within his assigned area of responsibility.

The *Glossary of Classification Terms* defines “specialist” as:

Specialist - Duties involve intensive application of knowledge and skills in a specific segment of an occupational area.

Mr. Perez performs his work as a member of a maintenance team in response to work orders. Mr. Perez performs his work under general direction and without specific instruction. In response to work orders, Mr. Perez evaluates the job requirements and the work site, determines the materials and repairs needed to complete the work, and completes the work at the journey level.

The overall scope of Mr. Perez's assigned duties, does not require the intensive application of knowledge and skills a majority of his work time to complete his assignments as a specialist as required by this classification. Mr. Perez is not assigned responsibilities as a senior, specialist, or lead worker and his position does not meet the primary allocating requirements of this class. His position should not be reallocated to the Maintenance Mechanic 3 class.

MAINTENANCE MECHANIC 2 (626K)

There are no Distinguishing Characteristics for this class.

Definition

This is the journey, working or occupational level of the series. Positions at this level perform a variety of skilled work in the operation, maintenance, repair, remodeling and construction of buildings, grounds, machinery, mechanical facilities and equipment, and hospital facilities, systems and equipment. Incumbents work independently and utilize a general knowledge of several related skill fields such as plumbing, electrical, welding, carpentry, and machinist work.

The *Glossary of Classification Terms* defines "journey-level" as:

"...Fully competent and qualified in all aspects of a body of work and given broad/general guidance, can complete work assignments to standard under minimal supervision. Also referred to as the working or fully qualified occupational level. "

As described on the PRR, Mr. Perez's duties are consistent with performing journey level work such as heating-ventilation-air conditioning maintenance, service, and repair; general maintenance and repair of fire alarm system and equipment; maintenance and repair of refrigeration units in the campus kitchen, and updating the automated lighting systems to ensure lighting is available for after-hours events. Mr. Perez assists with service and repairs that are assigned to co-workers. Mr. Perez is competent and qualified in all aspects of the body of work he performs. He works under general direction and completes his work assignments independently with minimal supervision. Mr. Perez's assigned responsibilities are a match for the anticipated level of work of the Definition of the Maintenance Mechanic 2.

Although the Typical Work statements identified in a class specification do not form the basis for an allocation, they lend support to the work envisioned within that class. Additionally, because this class does not contain Distinguishing Characteristics one can look to the Typical Work statements for guidance. The Typical Work statements relevant to Mr. Perez's assigned work include the following.

- Performs preventative maintenance and repairs on all types of mechanical equipment such as electrical drive motors, laundry, kitchen, hospital, laboratory and air-conditioning equipment; ...
- Performs maintenance, operation, and repair of electrical, mechanical and structural systems of buildings and utility distribution;
- Monitor safety, fire protection and environmental control equipment to ensure the building systems and equipment are operating in a satisfactory condition; respond to service request and secure necessary assistance; take preventative and emergency action to control malfunctions;
- Installs, maintains, and repairs electrical connections, switches, circuits, electrical equipment, thermostats, and valves

Mr. Perez's duties are fully consistent with the Definition and the Typical Work statements and the overall description of the Maintenance Mechanic 2 classification. Mr. Perez is responsible for performing skilled HVAC maintenance and repair. Additionally, he assists with electrical and other skilled trades work. For example, Mr. Perez maintains and repairs walk-in coolers and refrigeration units in the kitchen areas and he maintains the fire alarm systems. He helps resolve electrical problems and plumbing leaks. He ensures the exhaust fans on buildings are working correctly to keep classrooms cool. He participates in campus events set-up and is responsible for ensuring the lights are on for after hours and weekend events.

Mr. Perez works under general direction and the majority of his duties involve performing journey-level assignments within established standards and guidelines and without specific instruction consistent with the MM 2 class specification.

Most positions within the civil service system occasionally perform duties that appear in more than one classification. However, when determining the appropriate classification for a specific position, the duties and responsibilities of that position must be considered in their entirety and Director's Determination for the position must be allocated to the classification that provides the best fit overall for the majority of the position's duties and responsibilities. See *Dudley v. Dept. of Labor and Industries*, PRB Case No. R-ALLO-07-007 (2007).

It is very clear that Mr. Perez is a valued employee. However, a position's allocation is not based on an evaluation of performance or an individual's ability to perform higher-level work. Rather, it is based on the majority of work assigned to a position and how that work best aligns with the available job classes. Based on the primary focus of Mr. Perez's position and in comparison of his assigned duties and responsibilities to the relevant job classes, his position is accurately aligned with the requirements of the MM 2 class. Mr. Perez's position should remain allocated to the Maintenance Mechanic 2 class.

Appeal Rights

RCW 41.06.170 governs the right to appeal. RCW 41.06.10(4) provides, in relevant part, the following:

An employee incumbent in a position at the time of its allocation or reallocation, or the agency utilizing the position, may appeal the allocation or reallocation to the Washington Personnel Resources Board. Notice of such appeal must be filed in writing within thirty days of the action from which appeal is taken.

The mailing address for the Personnel Resources Board (PRB) is P. O. Box 40911, Olympia, Washington 98504-0911. The PRB Office is located on the 3rd floor of the Raad Building, 128 10th Avenue SW, Olympia, Washington. The main telephone number is (360) 407-4101, and the fax number is (360) 586-4694.

If no further action is taken, the Director's determination becomes final.

Cc: Raoul Perez, Employee
Steve Sloniker, Representative, WPEA
Mark Rogstad, Human Resource Consultant, YVC

Enclosure: List of Exhibits

RAOUL PEREZ v YVC
ALLO-15-010

A. Raoul Perez Exhibits

1. Director's Review Form received February 3, 2015
2. Refrigeration Credentials

B. YVC letter submitting exhibits dated March 12, 2015

1. January 5, 2015 YVC allocation determination letter
2. July 24, 2014 Position Review Request –employee portion
3. August 21, 2014vPosition Review Request –supervisor portion
4. Printout of work orders for January 2014 to July 2014
5. Position Descriptions
6. HVAC/DDC test score on April 7, 2009

C. Class Specifications

1. Maintenance Mechanic 1 (626J)
2. Maintenance Mechanic 2 (626K)
3. Maintenance Mechanic 3 (626L)
4. HVAC Technician (621J)